



HAWKE'S BAY REGIONAL COUNCIL

TE KAUNIHERA Ā-ROHE O TE MATAU-A-MĀUI

Unconfirmed

Minutes of a meeting of the Regional Transport Committee

Date: 3 May 2024

Time: 9.00am

Venue: Council Chamber
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
NAPIER

Present: Cr Tania Kerr (HDC) (Chair)
Cr M Buddo (HDC)
Mayor C Little (WDC) (*online*)
L Malde – NZTA
Cr K Price (NCC)
Cr Kate Taylor (CHBDC)
Cr M Williams (*online*)

In Attendance

Advisory members I Emmerson (Road Transport Association)
A Hallett (NZ Police) *from 10.01am*
D Murray (AA)
A Robin (HBRC Māori Committee)

TAG

B Cullen – HBRC Transport Strategy & Policy Analyst
M Hardie – WDC *online*
R Malley – NCC
S McKinley – CHBDC *online*
J Pannu – HDC *online*

K Brunton – Group Manager Policy & Regulation
P Martin – Senior Governance Advisor
Submitters – as noted

1. Welcome/Karakia /Housekeeping /Apologies

Councillor Tania Kerr, welcomed everyone and Api Robin opened the meeting with a karakia.

Due to the usual Committee Chair being online and the Deputy Chair being absent, it is necessary that the meeting elects a member of the Committee to Chair today's meeting.

Councillor Kate Taylor nominated Councillor Tania Kerr, seconded by Councillor Keith Price.

Resolution

RTC9/24 There being no further nominations Councillor Tania Kerr was elected, unopposed, to Chair the Regional Transport Committee meeting on 3 May 2024.

**Taylor/Price
CARRIED**

Resolution

RTC10/24 That the apologies for absence from Linda Stewart from NZTA and Bridget Wilson from Te Whatu Ora be accepted.

**Kerr/Taylor
CARRIED**

2. Conflict of interest declarations

There were no conflicts of interest declared.

3. Confirmation of Minutes of the Regional Transport Committee meeting held on 15 March 2024

RTC11/24 **Resolution**

Minutes of the Regional Transport Committee meeting held on Friday, 15 March 2024, a copy having been circulated prior to the meeting, were taken as read and confirmed as a true and correct record.

**Kerr/Taylor
CARRIED**

4. Regional Land Transport Plan Submissions

The Chair, Tania Kerr, introduced the item and sought the Committee's acceptance of a late submission (tabled) received from Alistair Haliburton for consideration and hearing as the last speaker for the day.

Mayor Craig Little and Councillor Martin Williams joined the meeting online at 9.10am

RTC12/24 **Resolutions**

That the Regional Transport Committee:

1. Receives and considers the Regional Land Transport Plan Submissions staff report.
2. Agrees to accept and consider the late submission to the Regional Land Transport Plan from Alastair Haliburton (following) due to the value and importance of the businesses making the submission.
3. Receives and considers the written and verbal submissions made by submitters on the Regional Land Transport Plan 2024-2034.

**Kerr/Taylor
CARRIED**

Late submission to HB Regional Transport Committee

I am making a late submission to today's RTC meeting – in respect to the NZTA / TREC planning that is being done with respect to the "Devil's Elbow" section of SH2 north of Napier.

In 2021, I was part of a group that made a submission to your committee, requesting that a

feasibility study be done by NZTA on alternate routing for SH2, away from the Devil's Elbow area. Chaired by Cr Martin Williams at that time, the Committee voted in an agreement that this should be done. We felt confident that a positive step had been taken for the future of all the communities from Napier to Gisborne / East Cape.

It would be interesting to know if this has actually been done in any measure, as a result the committee's direction ?

Now NZTA / TREC are in consultation on future plans for this same stretch of tortured Highway.

They advise that re-routing SH2 off the Devil's Elbow / Kaiwaka Range section is not viable, and instead propose large to massive options for re-engineering the existing route. However, there is no clarity / transparency on what the actual investment requirements are for these options, or if information is even fully developed.

This preliminary decision has massive consequences for the communities and economies from Napier to Gisborne / East Cape – FOR THE NEXT 2 GENERATIONS.

My submission proposes that the TREC decision to eliminate re-routing the highway has not been properly justified, and must be revisited. I have attached :

- *My submission to TREC, re Devil's Elbow proposals*

And supporting correspondence for this submission as follows :

- *Email from Leaderbrand*
- *Letter from Ovation NZ*
- *Letter form AFFCO NZ*
- *Email from Pan Pac Forest Products*
- *Email from Weatherell Transport*
- *Letter from Stephenson Transport*
- *Letter from Farmers Transport*

You will see that the submission makes use of the Rail Corridor to illustrate the relative merits of re-routing the highway vs re-developing the current route.

This does not mean to propose that the final solution should be the Rail Corridor exactly – only that the decision already taken to discount re-routing altogether, is very likely the wrong decision for a whole host of reasons.

It does seem likely that the Waikato Valley would hold the best solution.

Pretty much everyone who knows the area is convinced that this is a pivotal moment for the East Coast north of Napier – in terms of access vs isolation.

At the very minimum, as a first step, TREC need to :

1. *Demonstrate detailed financial analysis of the options, including lifetime costs and benefits – that support the decisions that they have made.*
2. *And if that is not possible, because the proper analysis has not been done, then they need to rescind the decisions taken so far – and do the proper analysis now.*

Alastair Haliburton

The Committee commenced hearing the verbal submissions by members of the public at 9.15am.

Lisa Malde obo the New Zealand Transport Agency (submission 18)

- *Current work on SH5 is part of the State Highway Investment Proposal (SHIP), not cyclone recovery work.*
- *NZTA is focused on cost-effective ways of getting roads up and running. Recovery and rebuilding activities are the highest priority nationally.*
- *The draft Government Policy Statement on Land Transport (GPS) was considered alongside the HB draft RLTP and a few RLTP projects don't align with the GPS – notably the*

walking/cycling option for the Waipawa road bridge.

- Projects not closely aligned to the draft GPS should be kept in the RLTP, however, as it is possible that some are acceptable and may be scaled back, e.g. the expressway four-laning project could be accepted at its minimum length – six kilometres.

Jim Galloway obo Federated Farmers (submission 89)

- Acknowledged the inclusion and highlighting of rural roads in the RLTP – the lifelines for the community and trade.
- Delayed and substandard roading repairs are not acceptable whether they are due to decision-making delays or red tape – need to do much better.
- SH2 Napier to Wairoa is a vital access route for food production. If the road is improved then more investment in agriculture and horticulture would be likely. Build it back better.

Guy Wellwood (submission 93)

- Just fixing roads is not visionary even with \$6b. HB can do without the Brookfields bridge and should only be restoring roads within the HB region, not up the length of SH5 or further up/down SH2.
- If we build more roads we will continue to get more cars on them, more congestion, more air pollution and need to spend even more on maintaining them.
- Rail for passengers and freight is the answer to road congestion. The GPS promotes rail in some parts of the country but no mention of HB rail at all. Need to promote rail in the RLTP or risk losing the rail lines that we have left.
- Kiwi Rail is a poor operator – it should be under NZTA control.
- The RLTP should stop focusing on cars and trucks and support rail and active transport.

Mhairi Rademaker and Ross McDonald obo Genesis Energy (submission 95) (online)

- Lake Waikaremoana power scheme is a vital lifeline and roads around it need to be maintained, particularly SH38 from Wairoa to Onepoto (unsealed).
- With significant projects planned by Genesis over the coming years having sealed roads would be beneficial. Unsealed roads are dangerous for heavy transport and tourists and present safety issues for the community.
- SH38 tars sealing has long been discussed and needs to be done.

Karl Goodchild (submission 24)

- Public transport use between Napier and Hastings has halved in recent years despite measures put in place to encourage use. The current Government is signaling that concessions will be removed, adding more costs for users.
- The solution is to ensure reliable service. More well paid bus drivers and alternative routes to the frequently closed expressway (accidents usually) would help.
- The rail link between Napier and Hastings should also be used for commuters.

Graeme Mueller obo St Columbus Havelock North Environment Group (submission 94)

- Traffic congestion is a problem only during commuter rush hours so building a four lane expressway at great expense would be a wasted effort.
- Suggest carpooling as an option, continuing with bus public transport and reintroducing rail services with park and ride options and additional train stops /stations.
- Auckland experience shows that building more roads is not the solution.

James Smith obo the National Road Carriers Assn. (submission 83) (online)

- Roothing network needs to be resilient – no point in returning cyclone affected roads to their previous state, they need to be built back better.
- Roothing is expensive and NZTA contributes less than half of the costs involved so would support other funding mechanisms being used including tolls.
- RLTP looks ahead 30 years – sound long term planning. Support all road safety initiatives in the RLTP and the proposed Commercial Vehicle Safety Centre at Eskdale.

Carol-Ann Guard (submission 78)

- The disabled community welcomed the MyWay service and would like to see this continued with an improved booking system and included in the accessibility concession scheme.
- Disabled support people should not be charged to use public transport services, including MyWay.
- It would be helpful if Bee Cards could incorporate some form of ID for the disabled – to inform bus drivers that a disabled person is boarding. Bus drivers also need more training on supporting the disabled, particularly the blind.
- Better communication with the disabled sector is needed, particularly for any service cancellations and timetable changes.

Walter Breustedt (submission 71)

- Mr Breustedt tabled a handout with more detailed information about his submission.
- Some RLTP projects being promoted are very expensive and detailed analysis needs to be completed, particularly the four lane extension for SH2 expressway. This project would not only promote the use of cars and therefore increase air pollution, but it would also take up more valuable land.
- Rooding projects will take 5/6 years to complete - need to promote people moving from using cars to using public transport in that period.
- Beyond the obvious fuel emissions, vehicle tyres used are now recognised as a major contributor to microplastics pollution.
- Reinstate the rail link between Napier and Hastings for public transport services.
- Encourage active and public transport rather than planning more projects for cars.

Allan Newton (submission 38)

- SH2 Wairoa to Tangoio is no longer fit for purpose. A fresh detailed feasibility study is required, using local expertise.
- The lack of a decent road contributes to the regions' isolation, poor health outcomes and lack of education opportunities for local residents.
- A second alternative route should also be developed.
- Nothing has been done for 60+ years. The region should have a modern 45 minute road route from Wairoa to Tangoio – the distance is only some 59 kms.

Andrea Manley and Todd Dawson obo the Port of Napier (submission 84)

- Focusing on how closely the RLTP matches with the GPS, it seems that the RLTP has been caught out and has different priorities, e.g. emission reduction items.
- Projects aligned with the current GPS look to provide efficient and resilient transport in a 'value for money' way and concerned that the RLTP priorities will miss out because they aren't aligned.
- Rail in other parts of the country features in the GPS – RLTP should include some reference to the Napier to Palmerston North rail link which is vital for commerce.
- Napier/Wairoa/Gisborne rail link is not supported as traffic volumes are too low.
- Alternative funding options for roads need to be considered/mentioned in the RLTP.

Meeting adjourned at 11.10am and reconvened at 11.15am

Glenn Marshall (submission 96)

- Transport system is broken – electric vehicles and buses are not the solution.
- Bicycle popularity is exploding and we need to move to cater for this and encourage cycling use. Road safety is a major barrier to cycling – cyclists are vulnerable.
- Need more signage/road markings to encourage cycle use and safety.

Ross McLeod obo the HB Regional Recovery Agency (submission 98)

- Councils require more funding to fix damaged roads, and the need to build more resilience into the roading network, across state highways and local/rural roads.
- The RLTP needs to be updated to ensure that it includes all roading resilience projects being

considered by local councils.

- A key measure of resilience is how would our roads would cope if there was another cyclone event. Proactive/preventative work needs to be carried out now.
- HB now has a one in 100 year opportunity to look at all options for the Napier - Wairoa section of this highway.
- As an observation – the budgets in the RLTP for maintenance, operations and renewals seem to be light.

Alastair Haliburton – late submission

- Submission was prepared following a public consultation meeting with Transport Rebuild East Coast (TREC) on the future of the SH 2 Devil’s Elbow section. Rather than being consultation, the meeting informed the community of the work that TREC will be carrying out with the limited budget they have. Four options were put forward, all based on keeping the road in-situ.
- All 4 options are considered poor as there is no space in the current area to widen the road corridor at all. Every option requires massive engineering works and may well lead to (again) building another dangerous, narrow windy road.
- The Devil’s Elbow has already been rebuilt twice in the past 40 years and building in the same place again is not sensible.
- The community must be provided with all options and must also be properly consulted with, including the provision of budgets and timelines for each option.

Submissions concluded and a general discussions of matters raised covered:

- Risk of RLTP not aligned with the GPS. The RLTP presents what the community wants, and while some of it will align with the GPS it is not intended for the RLTP to fully align with the GPS.
- It was queried whether the RLTP can influence the ‘optioneering’ for various state highways, particularly Devil’s Elbow.
- Disability matters raised seem to be incorporated into the RLTP and some helpful suggestions that will be taken further by staff.
- SH38 matters raised through Genesis submission will be investigated.
- Alternative funding options for transport projects may not be included in the RLTP as a separate topic and staff will look into this aspect.
- Time of use charges as a funding mechanism and emissions reduction option will be looked at by staff for possible inclusion in the RLTP.
- KiwiRail representation/attendance at RTC meetings has been disappointing. It would have been useful to have them in attendance today.
- RLTP currently doesn’t incorporate alternate routes for state highways and it would be useful to do so. It does include a “Form and Function” review of roading in HB and the alternate routes could be considered in that review to highlight the roads that would be considered alternate routes.
- The RLTP needs to at least mention alternative funding arrangements (such as public-private partnerships) to keep this option open.
- Work being undertaken by TREC (using different funding options to the RLTP) will be incorporated into the RLTP to provide a full picture of roading projects being undertaken and how they interact.

Api Robin closed the meeting with a karakia.

Closure:

There being no further business the Chair declared the meeting closed at 12.06pm on Friday, 3 May 2024.

Signed as a true and correct record.

Date:

Chair: