



## Meeting of the HB Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee

**Date:** 25 March 2024  
**Time:** 1.30pm  
**Venue:** Council Chamber  
Hawke's Bay Regional Council  
159 Dalton Street  
NAPIER

### Agenda

---

Item	Title	Page
1.	Welcome/Karakia/Notices/Apologies	
2.	Conflict of Interest Declarations	
3.	Confirmation of Minutes of the HB Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee meeting held on 27 November 2023	
<b>Decision Items</b>		
4.	Independent review into the HB CDEM Group response to Cyclone Gabrielle	3

---





## HB CDEM Group Joint Committee

25 March 2024

### Subject: Independent review into the HB CDEM Group response to Cyclone Gabrielle

#### Reason for report

1. This report provides background and an overview of the scope, procurement processes and methodology for the conduct of the *Independent review into Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group's response to Cyclone Gabrielle* (the review) to support the Bush International Consulting Limited brief on the findings and recommendations from the review.
2. This report also provides a snapshot of Hawke's Bay CDEM Group activities since Cyclone Gabrielle to highlight growth in Hawke's Bay CDEM Group capability over the last 12 months.
3. Mr Bush of Bush International Consulting Limited, will be present at the meeting to formally present the findings and to release the Independent Review Report to the Committee.

#### Officers' recommendations

4. Council officers recommend that the Joint Committee accepts the findings of the *Independent Review into the Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group response to Cyclone Gabrielle* in full, and that the Coordinating Executives Group is asked to provide, at pace, an implementation programme to achieve the step change sought by those findings.

#### Executive Summary

5. Cyclone Gabrielle caused significant flooding, damage to critical infrastructure, widespread damage to homes and businesses, and significant impact across the horticultural and rural communities in Hawke's Bay. Eight Hawke's Bay people lost their lives during the cyclone.
6. The Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Joint Committee committed to Hawke's Bay communities that an independent review of the Cyclone Gabrielle response would be completed. A Terms of Reference (ToR) and Framework for the review were approved by the Joint Committee on 26 June 2023.
7. The purpose of the independent review was to assess the operational performance of the Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group's (the Group) response to Cyclone Gabrielle, with a particular emphasis on:
  - 7.1. the systems and processes
  - 7.2. roles and responsibilities of Group members and partners
  - 7.3. and to what extent the implementation of pre-existing arrangements contributed to the effective management of the response for mana whenua and the community.
8. A robust procurement process was conducted to source a contractor in accordance with the Hawke's Bay Regional Council Procurement Guidelines. Bush International Consulting Limited was confirmed as the successful contractor following the procurement process and formally engaged on 24 August 2023 to undertake the review.

9. Since Cyclone Gabrielle, work has continued on HB CDEM's priority work streams in alignment with the 2022-2024 Work Programme and previous review priorities in parallel with the review. It is noted that the progress on many of the priority areas was hindered by the ongoing response to Cyclone Gabrielle, however has been boosted in the last six months as the transition to recovery has occurred.

## Background

10. Cyclone Gabrielle caused significant flooding, damage to critical infrastructure, widespread damage to homes and businesses and significant impact across the horticultural and rural communities in Hawke's Bay. Eight Hawke's Bay people lost their lives during the cyclone.
11. In the days leading up to Cyclone Gabrielle, the MetService forecast indicated significant impacts for the upper North Island, north of Tairāwhiti. In their review<sup>1</sup>, the MetService identified that modelling did not accurately reflect rainfall volume and locations across a number of catchments in Hawke's Bay and this flowed through to their forecast. The impacts on major river systems were modelled by Hawke's Bay Regional Council based on this forecast.
12. National Institute of Water & Atmospheric Research Ltd (NIWA) has subsequently completed a scientific assessment of the flood flows that occurred at 20 river gauging sites across Hawke's Bay during Cyclone Gabrielle. In its report<sup>2</sup> NIWA described that Cyclone Gabrielle represented a very severe flood event over the entire Hawke's Bay region.
13. The Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Joint Committee committed to Hawke's Bay communities that an independent review of the CDEM Group's response to Cyclone Gabrielle would be undertaken. This review was intended to give the communities of Hawke's Bay confidence that lessons learned from the event will be used to improve future emergency event responses. The key background aspects to the review are discussed following.

## Development of the review scope

14. The review's Terms of Reference (ToR) and Framework to support the review were developed in consultation with Joint Committee members and Te Kahui Ohanga o Takitimu (TKO). A clear focus of the review was the requirement for the communities to have the opportunity to give voice to how Cyclone Gabrielle had impacted them. The Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Joint Committee approved the review ToR<sup>3</sup> and Framework<sup>4</sup> on 26 June 2023, having previously provided feedback and clear outcomes being sought from the review.
15. The purpose of the independent review was to assess the operational performance of the Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group's (the Group) response to Cyclone Gabrielle, with a particular emphasis on:
  - 15.1. the systems and processes
  - 15.2. roles and responsibilities of Group members and partners, and
  - 15.3. to what extent the implementation of pre-existing arrangements contributed to the effective management of the response for mana whenua and the community.

---

<sup>1</sup> MetService Report on the Performance of the Warning System for the Auckland Storm and Cyclone Gabrielle, 2024

<sup>2</sup> NIWA Cyclone Gabrielle Analysis of Flood Flows report, 29 February 2024

<sup>3</sup> Independent review into Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group's response to Cyclone Gabrielle Terms of Reference, 20 June 2023

[FINAL-Hawkes-Bay-Operational-Review-Terms-of-Reference-V0.4-20-June-2023.pdf \(hbemergency.govt.nz\)](#)

<sup>4</sup> Independent review into Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group's response to Cyclone Gabrielle Framework, 20 June 2023

[FINAL-Review-Framework-Hawkes-Bay-CDEM-Group-Cyclone-Gabrielle-Version-0.4-20-June-2023-.pdf \(hbemergency.govt.nz\)](#)

16. The review was to focus on the timeframe between the initial warning of the cyclone through to the demobilisation of the Group Emergency Coordination Centre (9 February – end-April 2023), including the termination of the State of National Emergency<sup>5</sup>.
17. Review outcomes were to focus on improving resilience and ensuring that the Hawke's Bay CDEM Group has robust emergency management capability and capacity before, during and after an emergency to support better emergency management outcomes for Hawke's Bay. Review findings were to outline strengths and areas for improvement and will inform the Hawke's Bay CDEM Group work programme aligned to the Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Plan.

### **Procurement to support the review**

18. To support sourcing of appropriate contractors to undertake the review based on the agreed ToR and Framework, and to provide transparency that robust and current processes were followed, procurement was conducted in accordance with Hawke's Bay Regional Council's Procurement Guidelines with support from the Hawke's Bay Regional Council Procurement Team. The process and associated timeframes for procurement were endorsed by the Joint Committee on 26 June 2023.
19. The procurement process involved the development of a comprehensive procurement plan and Request for Proposals including:
  - 19.1. supporting documentation
  - 19.2. pre-market engagement
  - 19.3. advertisement through the Government Electronic Tenders Service (GETS), and
  - 19.4. establishment of a Panel for proposal evaluation and preferred contractor recommendation.
20. Subsequent to the Evaluation Panel decision on a preferred contractor, contract negotiation and award and finalisation of contractual arrangements processes were conducted, resulting in Bush International Consulting Limited being engaged on 24 August 2023 to undertake the review.

### **Review methodology**

21. The methodology for the Bush International Consulting Limited review followed the guidance detailed in the review's ToR and Framework, with the development of a detailed Project Plan to support the review. Mr Bush's report will speak further to the specific methodology used. In summary, the activities to inform the review outcomes included:
  - 21.1. Documentation review – of internal Hawke's Bay CDEM Group and external agencies' documentation.
  - 21.2. Interviews and engagement – conducting interviews at the local, regional and national level with individuals across multiple agencies involved in the response to Cyclone Gabrielle and engagement with Te Kahui Ohanga o Takitimu (TKO).
  - 21.3. Community engagement – with community representatives through the facilitation of Community Focus Groups, engagement with iwi, hapū and Marae, and analysis of data captured from approximately 1000 community responses to a survey specifically designed for the review.
  - 21.4. Review of draft Review Report – using a Review Advisory Group with representatives from mana whenua, welfare, lifelines and CDEM for technical expertise to provide guidance on the draft report and themes; and engaging with other key subject-matter experts involved in the Cyclone Gabrielle response for technical fact-checking.

<sup>5</sup> At 8:43am on 14 February 2023 a State of National Emergency declared owing to Cyclone Gabrielle for the Northland, Auckland, Waikato, Bay of Plenty, Tairāwhiti and Hawke's Bay Regions.

## Hawke's Bay CDEM Group activities

22. Since Cyclone Gabrielle, work has continued in alignment with the 2022-2024 Work Programme.<sup>6</sup> This Work Programme was under way pre-Cyclone Gabrielle and includes a series of 'priority one' work streams across Risk Reduction, Community Resilience, Operational Readiness, Recovery, and Governance and Management.
23. A snapshot of the comprehensive work conducted at local and CDEM Group level since Cyclone Gabrielle has been developed to highlight that significant work has continued in parallel with review activities (*Figure 1*). The work shown in the snapshot has occurred since the response to Cyclone Gabrielle, and the demobilisation of Group and local response arrangements and debriefing, which were ongoing into May 2023.
24. The snapshot is not an exhaustive list of the work completed. Substantially, community leadership has and always will play an important role in the network that is Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management. The scale and scope of activities that have been undertaken across the Hawke's Bay region by communities is also significant. Whether updating community phone trees or re-establishing local Community Watch Networks, these important actions all form the network of community resilience and preparedness outcomes.

---

<sup>6</sup> Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Work Programme 2022-2024.

This Work Programme details the major work streams and projects during the 2022-23 and 2023-24 financial years across Risk Reduction; Community Resilience Planning; Operational Readiness; Recovery; and Governance and Management.



# HAWKE'S BAY CDEM GROUP

## WORK PROGRAMME SNAPSHOT

### RISK REDUCTION

- 1 Hazard research
- 2 Hazard information dissemination
- 3 Tsunami risk reduction
- 4 Support to long-term risk reduction and hazard policy
- 5 River Telemetry System Project
- 6 Review of catchment flood models

### OPERATIONAL READINESS

#### Training

CIMS 3	19	trained
CIMS 4	168	trained
Response & Recovery Leadership   RRANZ	3	trained
Capability Development Pathway - course dypmt	19	courses
Community Hub 'train the trainer'	30	trained

#### 2024 / 2025 Course Projection

Course	Estimated trained
60 Courses	
Emergency Management Essentials	440
Working in a Coordination Centre	160
CIMS Function training	100
Welfare Needs Assessors	100

#### Exercises

Local Emergency Operations Centres | 9

Group Emergency Coordination Centre | TBA\*

\* National Tier 4 Exercise Rū Whenua | June 2024

### PUBLIC EDUCATION CAMPAIGNS



ShakeOut (Oct 2023)



Volunteers Day (Nov 2023)



Get Summer Ready (Dec 23 / Jan 24)



Tsunami Hikoï Week ( 11 - 15 Mar 2024)

### COMMUNITY RESILIENCE

#### Local Community Engagement

50 Community Engagement Activities across all Local Authorities

60 Community Emergency Hubs in progress

#### Community Hardware

Resources to support community-led needs including generators and containers for bulk storage of emergency supplies.

#### Group Community Engagement

Establishment of Regional Community Resilience Working Group | July 2023.

60 Priority communities identified by Working Group.

#### Resources developed to support community resilience

- Revised Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Community Resilience Strategy (Aug 2023) to include Community Emergency Hub Model.
- Hawke's Bay Community Resilience Framework including:
  - Community Emergency Hub Guide.
  - Community Resilience Plan (CRP) template for communities.
- Hawke's Bay Lifestyle Block Emergency Preparedness Handbook in collaboration with Rural Advisory Group (Nov 2023).
- Local Older Persons Emergency Preparedness Guide.
- Civil Defence Centre Guidelines (February 2024).
- Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Welfare Needs assessment System.

Figure 1: Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Work Programme Snapshot (May 2023-March 2024)

25. The next section of the report outlines all of the work that has been completed or is under way since the response to Cyclone Gabrielle. This work involves the agencies and local authorities that make up the Hawke's Bay CDEM Group and includes:

#### *Risk Reduction*

- 25.1. Risk Reduction programmes in the short-term remained focused on hazard research, hazard information dissemination, tsunami risk reduction, and support to the long-term Risk Reduction and Hazard Policy. There has been ongoing work on the Tsunami Risk Reduction Programme with the review of Tsunami Evacuation Zones based on updated tsunami modelling<sup>7</sup> including engagement with coastal local authorities and communities.
- 25.2. Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Office Emergency Management permanent staff are supporting the Hawke's Bay Regional Council in the review of policies for all natural hazards impacting the Hawke's Bay region, in consideration of climate change and urban development.
- 25.3. Hawke's Bay Regional Council is leading the 3-year project to upgrade the River Telemetry System which commenced post-Cyclone Gabrielle. This project is a site-by-site review and equipment replacement to support future site resilience. Noting that the Hawke's Bay Independent Flood Review is still in progress, flood modelling work is also under way in consideration of data from the NIWA Cyclone Gabrielle Analysis of Flood Flows report<sup>8</sup> to inform the review of catchment flood models.

#### *Community Resilience*

- 25.4. Community Resilience programmes focused on community resilience planning with communities, and public information and education have been delivered across the region, led primarily by local authorities. Community engagement activities at the local level across all local authorities have been conducted in consideration of ongoing recovery programmes and in collaboration with Emergency Services.
- 25.5. Community engagement activities across the region have included Community Hub and Civil Defence Centre planning, hui with iwi, hapū and marae, and Community Resilience workshops. Support to enable community-led strengthening of capability through Community Hub planning and resourcing with critical supplies has been a priority for all local authorities. This has seen planning for 60 community resilience hubs underway across the region since the cyclone.
- 25.6. Post-Cyclone Gabrielle, the Regional Community Resilience Working Group was established to provide a coordinated multi-agency approach to community resilience. The Working Group has identified priority communities impacted by Cyclone Gabrielle requiring immediate support to build their resilience. To support these, and all communities in the development of emergency preparedness plans, work is underway to develop a Community Resilience Framework with practical tools. A Community Emergency Hub model has also been adopted, using practised and tested resources from other regions.
- 25.7. There have been region-wide public education campaigns promoting readiness and specific preparedness for hazards (earthquake and tsunami). In addition to the region-wide campaigns, local authorities have conducted further targeted campaigns, both externally with communities and internally focussed for local authority staff. There has also been behind-the-scenes work to improve current front-facing communications for Hawke's Bay CDEM with a review and refresh of the Hawke's Bay CDEM website and supporting information for the delivery of emergency preparedness workshops as part of the Community Resilience programmed activities.

---

<sup>7</sup> 2022 tsunami modelling using Level 3 LiDAR.

<sup>8</sup> NIWA Cyclone Gabrielle Analysis of Flood Flows report, 29 February 2024



### *Operational Readiness*

- 25.8. Operational readiness programmes cover the review of the operating framework and response structure, emergency communications planning, shared emergency information systems, welfare needs assessment platforms and operational workforce capability.
- 25.9. Priority work on a Capability Development Pathway has been completed, with preparations under way for the roll-out the programme across three main pathways: general Emergency Management awareness and support Emergency Operations/Coordination Centres, support Civil Defence Centres, and Local and Group Controllers. Aligned to these pathways is the identification and design of specific training courses to support each pathway. Future course delivery and attendance projections will provide a significant boost to the emergency management capability at the local and Group level. There will be a requirement for a significant commitment from local authority staff and other agencies to attend training in addition to their day-to-day roles. The development of the pathways, course design and programme implementation have not stopped the continuation of training in the interim at the local and Group level. In the last 10 months, over 230 people across multiple agencies, including volunteers, have been trained based on current courses and current training programmes.
- 25.10. The Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Welfare Needs Assessment System has been completed with consultation on this system currently in progress through the member agencies of the Welfare Coordination Group. The development of a new regional information sharing platform is underway with the roll out scheduled for mid-2024.
- 25.11. Post-Cyclone Gabrielle agency reviews by Fire and Emergency New Zealand, New Zealand Police, National Emergency Management Agency and St John's Ambulance have been completed or are under way. These will help inform the other recommendations and learnings for the Hawke's Bay region.

### *Recovery*

- 25.12. Recovery programmes to build recovery capacity for Hawke's Bay and a review of the current Hawke's Bay Recovery Strategy is currently being scoped in consultation with the Regional Recovery Authority (RRA).

### *Governance and Management*

- 25.13. The high priority work on the review of the Hawke's Bay CDEM Group Plan and partnering with Mana whenua in Emergency Management are progressing.

### **Next steps**

- 26. While the report has now been formally received, preparatory work has already commenced to ensure that the report's recommendations and suggestions can be addressed quickly, and to achieve the extent of transformation and innovation that the scope of the review will require for its recommendations to be successfully considered and implemented where possible.
- 27. Agencies, local authorities and organisations that form the Hawke's Bay CDEM Group, have also not been waiting to take action following Cyclone Gabrielle. Many key actions, some outlined in this report, speak to the levels of focus and seriousness by all agencies.
- 28. A sub-working group of the Coordinating Executive Group (CEG) has been formed and this will provide recommendations on the short-term recommendations and actions to undertake to the CEG initially, to then be presented to the Joint Committee along with what an appropriate structure to successfully implement the review outcomes for the future. Again, this will be critical to achieve the transformational step change being sought, as opposed to incremental changes. The intention is that this will be presented at the Joint Committee's June meeting, if not earlier.

29. It is also important to note that this review is one of a number of reviews under way, including the *Government Inquiry into the Response to the North Island Severe Weather Events* being led by Sir Jerry Mateparae. Collating and understanding all of the recommendations and connections across all of these reviews will be critical to ensuring the Hawke's Bay CDEM Group is fit for future and not disconnected from potential wider sector change or reform.

#### **Considerations of tangata whenua**

30. Mana whenua engagement has been an intrinsic component of the review processes outlined in development of the review ToR and Framework and engagement associated with the review methodology.

#### **Financial and resource implications**

31. There will undoubtedly be financial and resourcing implications from the review. The full scope and extent of these is unknown at this point, however, will be reported to the Joint Committee as part of the development of the implementation programme.

#### **Decision-making process**

32. Councils and their committees are required to make every decision in accordance with the requirements of the Local Government Act 2002 (the Act). Staff have assessed the requirements in relation to this item and have concluded:
  - 32.1. The decision does not significantly alter the service provision or affect a strategic asset, nor is it inconsistent with an existing policy or plan.
  - 32.2. The use of the special consultative procedure is not prescribed by legislation.
  - 32.3. The persons affected by this decision are the people of Hawke's Bay.
  - 32.4. Given the nature and significance of the decision, and also the persons likely to be affected by, or have an interest in the decisions made, the Joint Committee can exercise its discretion and make a decision without consulting with the community.

#### **Recommendations**

That the Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

1. Receives and considers the *Independent review into the HB CDEM Group response to Cyclone Gabrielle* staff report.
2. Agrees that the decisions to be made are not significant and that the Joint Committee can exercise its discretion and make decisions on this issue without conferring directly with the community or persons likely to have an interest in the decision.
3. Accepts the findings of the *Independent review into the HB CDEM Group response to Cyclone Gabrielle* in full.
4. Requests that the HB CDEM Coordinating Executives Group reports back to the Joint Committee, with pace, on the approach to how the review findings will be implemented, including an implementation programme to achieve the step change sought.

#### **Authored & Approved by:**

**Doug Tate**  
CHBDC Chief Executive

#### **Attachment/s**

There are no attachments for this report.