



MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE REGIONAL COUNCIL

Date: Monday 11 June 2012

Time: 9.00am

Venue: Council Chamber
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
NAPIER

Present: A J Dick
T Gilbertson
N Kirton
E McGregor
L Remmerswaal
K Rose
C Scott
E von Dadelszen
F Wilson - Chairman

In Attendance: A Newman – Chief Executive
M Mohi – Chairman – Maori Committee
L Hooper – Governance & Corporate Administration Manager
EA Lambert – Group Manager External Relations
M Adye – Group Manager Asset Management & Biosecurity
I Maxwell – Group Manager Resource Management
H Codlin – Group Manager Strategic Development

1. WELCOME/PRAYER/APOLOGIES/NOTICES

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting and Councillor Scott offered the prayer.

Resolution

RC4/12 That the apologies for absence be accepted from:

Councillor von Dadelszen on Thursday, 14 June from 1130am until 2pm

Councillor Gilbertson and Mr Mohi from 9am until 1030am on Tuesday, 12 June

Councillor Dick for an hour from 1030 today, 11 June

Councillor Kirton Thursday 14 June.

**Rose/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

Councillor Dick gave notice that provision for a Stock Effluent discharge facility to be built in year 4 of the LTP would be put forward for Council's consideration as an addition to the Internal Staff Submission later in the week.

Mr Adye gave notice that the Kairakau Beach community targeted rate scheme resulting from the decisions of the Hearing Panel would also be put forward for inclusion in the LTP as an addition to the Internal Submission.

Councillor Wilson gave notice that the earlier submission from WDC for funds under the Regional Communities Funding project would be included in deliberations.

2. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

Councillor von Dadelszen declared an interest in submission 6 and item 12 of the Internal submission.

Councillor McGregor declared an interest in submissions 137 and 144.

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

It was noted that a record number of submissions had been received this year, and that it was pleasing that there was so much interest in what Council does and is planning to do.

RC5/12 **Resolutions**

That Council:

1. Agrees that the decisions to be made on issues submitted on the draft Long Term Plan 2011/12 are made after the provisions included in Section 83 and 84 of the Local Government Act 2002 have been followed.
2. Receives and considers the verbal and written submissions.

**von Dadelszen/Rose
CARRIED**

4. STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Mr Newman provided Councillors with the rationale underlying the staff requests to carry forward unspent budgets for work still to be completed into the next financial year. In particular, the use of unspent funds for agricultural collection being re-targeted toward the more rural Wairoa and CHB farming communities next year.

Resolutions**That Council**

1. Agrees that the decisions to be made on issues submitted to the draft Long Term Plan 2012-22 are made after the provisions included in sections 83 and 84 of the Local Government Act 2002 have been followed.
2. Receives and considers Council's internal submission.

Project 151 – Strategic Policy – Hazardous Waste/Substances Management

3. Approves the carry forward in project 151-2380 of \$12,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to cover costs associated with the unwanted agrichemical collection targeting the Wairoa and Central Hawke's Bay rural communities in particular, the more remote pastoral farmers in those regions.

**Scott/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

Project 179 – Economic Development

4. Approves the carry forward in project 179-001-2380 of \$50,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to cover costs associated with commitments to the Massey University market segmentation and precision agriculture projects.

**Dick/Scott
CARRIED**

Project 192 – Strategy and Planning

5. Approves the carry forward in project 192-001-2380 of \$70,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to cover costs associated with statutory planning projects.

**Rose/McGregor
CARRIED**

Project 310 – Regional Groundwater Research

6. Approves the carry forward in project 310-2380 of \$100,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to cover costs associated with the Heretaunga groundwater investigations.

**von Dadelszen/Rose
CARRIED**

Project 385 – Regional Park Reserves (Cycleways)

7. Approves the carry forward in Project 385-003 (cost code 2395) of \$0.75m 2011/12 to 2012/13 and a further budget provision of \$1.55m under this same consultancy budget code, to cover the cost of Landscapes, Water, and Wineries Ride Cycleway Developments, noting that this expenditure is funded \$1.2m from grants from Central Government and other parties and \$1.1m from loan funding.

**Gilbertson/Scott
CARRIED**

Project 385 – Regional Park Reserves (Other Open Space Projects)

8. Approves the carry forward in project 385-051 (cost code 2650) of \$900,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to provide funding for future open space projects, noting that this is funded from loans.

**Scott/McGregor
CARRIED**

Project 711 – Hazard Identification and Mitigation

9. Approves the carry forward in project 711-001 (cost code 2380) of \$20,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to cover costs associated with completing regional tsunami inundation modelling and publishing the final technical report.

**Rose/Scott
CARRIED**

Project 713 – Civil Defence Emergency Management Coordination

10. Approves the carry forward in project 713-2750 of \$30,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to cover costs associated with completing the review of the Hawke's Bay Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Plan.
11. Approves the carry forward in project 713-2395 of \$25,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to cover costs associated with completing the establishment of the new Group Emergency Coordination Centre.

**von Dadelszen/Rose
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council commenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mr Paddy Maloney, submitter number **521**, • supported Te Mata Park Trust's application for funding to build a Visitor Information Centre. • Regional asset used by residents and visitors every day of the year. • With so many people visiting the park there is a decided lack of facilities and access to the peak can be very difficult. • Centre designed to include more parking so that large buses can be accommodated at the gate and passengers shuttled to the Peak by smaller vehicles.

Ms Katherine Halliday, submitter number **520**, • supported Te Mata Park Trust's application for funding to build a Visitor Information Centre • means of providing sufficient facilities for the 200,000+ visitors to the Park and the Peak. • planned retail area and café will provide future revenue to meet ongoing maintenance and running costs.

Mr Tom Belford, submitter number **184**, • supported development of the Te Mata Park Visitor Centre • webcasting Council meetings • opposed to providing funding for the Ruataniwha water storage scheme in the LTP without having more information available from the various feasibility studies underway. • Clarification given to Mr Belford that the sum given in the LTP provisional on a decision to be made at a later date once feasibility study complete. • noted there would be further consultation with the community prior to any project implementation.

Mr Barry Crabbe, submitter number **79**, • supported amalgamation of the 5 local councils, using Tauranga as an example • supported further development of public transport systems in the region. • his view that building low level dams on farms on the Ruataniwha Plains would provide sufficient individual water storage to render a large water storage scheme unnecessary • stated the need for sites to collect electronic components for recycling with increasing amounts of these types of components being discarded.

The meeting adjourned at 1030am and reconvened at 1045am

4. STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Ms Lambert provided the rationale for the additional funding for completion of the Prosperity Study. Initially the study was to be funded by contributions from all 5 councils in the region, but when agreement on the scope of the study and appointment of the Study Leader were delayed the HBRC Chief Executive and Chairman had made the decision to take the lead and pay for those from this Council's budgets. The detail supporting the additional funding requested would be provided for Council's approval at the 27 June Regional Council meeting prior to the adoption of the LTP. Therefore if the decision was made not to fund completion of the Study, the \$60,000 provisionally put into the budget would then be removed prior to publication of the Plan.

RC7/12

Resolutions

That Council

Project 840 – Community Representation and Regional Leadership (Social and Economic Study)

12. Approves the carry forward in project 840-013 (cost code 2380) of \$20,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 to provide funding for the completion of the Hawke's Bay Social and Economic Study.
13. Provisionally, approves new expenditure in project 840-013 (cost code 2380) of \$60,000 for 2012/13 to provide funding for the completion of the Hawke's Bay Social and Economic Study subject to approval of the study at the 27 June 2012 Council meeting.

**Dick/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mr David George, submitter number 168, spoke about the hub and spoke Tourism model and how that could work in Hawke's Bay as demonstrated in other parts of the world and New Zealand.

Mr John Cheyne on behalf of Te Taiao Hawke's Bay Environment Forum, submitter number 191, spoke about the group's formation as an 'umbrella' group including representatives of various environmental groups. • Group concerned about development of the Biodiversity Strategy and sustainable development in Hawke's Bay. • Group concerned about land use intensification impacts on water quality should the Ruataniwha Plains water storage project go ahead. • Advocated for a biodiversity strategy to underpin upcoming plan changes in Tukituki and other catchments • requested that work on developing the Strategy be better resourced to enable completion sooner, suggesting resource budget of \$100,000 per year.

Mr Derek Williams, submitter number 50, spoke about water quality testing for recreational use at Lake Tutira, • asked whether Otatara Maori could be remunerated to look after the Tutaekuri River from the Puketapu Bridge to Brookfield Bridge or estuary. • explained his views on the Central Hawke's Bay wastewater • suggested the use of a Youth Corps type of programme to undertake clean-up projects along riverbanks, at river access points, and at Regional parks.

Ms Rosemary Marriott on behalf of Hawkes Bay & Chatham Islands Smokefree Coalition, submitter number 29, • Coalition's vision for smokefree outdoor recreation areas, • asked that Council provide funding for signage at Council recreation areas, similar to Auckland programme where a statement about the Park being a smokefree space was added to Park signage.

Mr Mark von Dadelszen, submitter number 6, • interested in waste wood being put into productive use for woodturners and other craftsmen. • intent to enter into further discussions with HBRC and TLA staff to explore the development of a protocol for the guild to be informed of works and be involved in the recovery of timber where appropriate as suggested by staff.

Ms Christine Cheyne on behalf of Massey University, submitter number 193, Associate Professor of Resource and Environmental Planning, • supported the Research Alliance between Massey and HBRC. • relationship has flourished and research projects related to water storage and catchment based resilience have been initiated. • endorsed the programme for strategic alliances in the LTP. • Massey will expand mechanisms for linking student research to the goals of Council and the community around sustainability through 'living laboratories'.

4. **STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Ms Lambert explained the rationale for the requests to carry forward funding for the Earthquake exhibition, which has been held over until the Museum redevelopment is completed, and regional community facilities funding which has not yet been allocated.

RC8/12

Resolutions

That Council

Project 877 – Specific Regional Projects

Hawke's Bay Cultural Trust Earthquake Exhibition in Napier Museum

14. Approves the carry forward in project 877001 (cost code 2395) of \$45,000 from 2011/12 to 2012/13 for the funding of further upgrades to the earthquake museum display planned as part of the new Museum building project.

**Scott/Rose
CARRIED**

Project 893 – Regional Infrastructure

15. Approves the carry forward in project 893-001 (cost code 2395) of \$2.5m from 2011/12 to 2012/13 (\$1.25m) and to 2013/14 (\$1.25m) to provide funding for regional projects within those years, noting that this expenditure is funded \$900,000 from the sale of land non-investment account and \$1,600,000 from loan funding.

**Rose/McGregor
CARRIED**

The meeting adjourned at 12.25pm and reconvened at 1pm.

3. **SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mr Pat Hickey, submitter number 76, • supported an alternate bus route to better cater for the elderly living in Parkvale, Hastings. • nearest bus stop is too far for many of the residents to walk to.

Mr Trevor Taurima, submitter number 187, • supported proposal to transfer ownership of property in Tutira to the local hapu.

Ms Tania Hopmans on behalf of Maungaharuru-Tangitu Incorporated, submitter number 121, • supported proposal to transfer ownership of Lake Tutira property to Maori hapu. • asked that Council undertake an assessment of the catchment to develop a strategy to address the environmental and ecological issues in the catchment.

Mrs Ann Wilson, submitter number **61**, • supported alternative bus route to better cater for the growth of the Parkvale area of Hastings.

Mr Allen Den Boer, submitter number **60**, • supported an alternative bus route to better serve the residents of Parkvale.

Mr Larry Dallimore, submitter number **108**, spoke about the erosion at Westshore • believes the erosion was not caused by the 1931 earthquake, but by the Port's breakwater.

Mr Roy Fraser on behalf of Rotary Club Waipukurau, submitter number **136**, • supported a cycle/walkway in Central Hawke's Bay, • need for safe cycling between Waipukurau and Waipawa.

Mr Campbell Chard, Ricky Jensen and Richard Daykins on behalf of the Ruataniwha Water Users Group, submitter number **8** • supported the water storage project and integrated water management in the catchment.

4. **STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Mr Adye and Mr Newman provided the rationale for the request to carry forward funds for maintenance and development at the Guppy Road site.

RC9/12

Resolution

That Council

Capital Expenditure – Proposed Guppy Road Building Extensions

16. Approves the carry forward of \$630,000 to provide provision for funding of deferred maintenance of Council's current Operations Group offices and for the extension of that office should it proceed.

**Kirton/Dick
CARRIED**

3. **SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mr Colin Stone on behalf of Sport Hawke's Bay, submitter number **13**, • supported ongoing development of the Sport and Active Recreation Strategy and development of Community facilities for recreation, including tier 1 hockey turf at Regional Sports Park.

The meeting adjourned at 3pm and reconvened at 3.20pm.

Mr Matthew Lawson on behalf of ECOED, submitter number **28**, spoke about the work that the organization does in environmental education and the Kaweka Kiwi programme. • requested \$35,000 per year for the next three years for ongoing pest control development.

Ms Kristen Price on behalf of the Enviroschools Foundation, submitter number **106**, spoke about the growth of Enviroschools nationally and in Hawke's Bay, with 30 schools in the region now. • requested Council continues to provide funding to support the programmes, and increase 15% per year (\$2100).

Ms Christine Morrison on behalf of the Enviroschools Foundation, submitter number **96**, spoke about her work as a part-time Enviroschools facilitator working in CHB • supported Enviroschools request for continued funding assistance.

Ms Girvan Roberts on behalf of the Enviroschools Foundation, submitter number **96**, spoke about her work as an Enviroschools facilitator, highlighting the work done at Eskdale School.

Ms Fleur Wainohu on behalf of Te Kura Kaupapa Maori, submitter number **104**, spoke about the achievements of Enviroschools at te Kura, highlighting the success of the vegetable garden and the flow-on effects in the community.

AJ Egalstine and Pukeho School students on behalf of the Enviroschools Foundation, submitter number **103**, spoke about the various Enviroschools projects at their school.

Mr Reginald Corbett, submitter number **58**, supported an alternative bus route to better service the residents of the Parkvale area of Hastings given recent growth in the area.

4. STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Mr Newman provided further detail relating to the projected cost for the Ruataniwha water storage project and Council having an equity stake in the dam should it proceed.

Regional income adjustments relating to leasehold land resulted from the number of properties being freeholded.

Amendments to figures and notes in the Resource Management Charges section of the LTP were the result of proofreading to ensure the clarity and consistency of the charges and how they would be applied.

RC10/12 Resolutions

That Council

17. Pursuant to Model Standing Orders 3.3.7, Council agrees to continue the meeting past the six-hour limit.

**von Dadelszen/Scott
CARRIED**

Project 996 – Ruataniwha Water Augmentation Investment

18. Revises the cost of the Ruataniwha water harvesting project from \$170m to \$230m and, further, that Council's financial commitment to the purchase of equity in this project be retained at \$80m.
19. Will develop appropriate mechanisms to ensure it meets the project's environmental objectives and outcomes.

**Gilbertson/Rose
CARRIED**

Regional Income Adjustments

20. Approves adjustments be made to the draft LTP to reflect the impact of the increase in freeholdings from 100 to 274 properties, noting that adjustments will be made to future rental income from Napier leasehold land properties offset by increases in interest income earned from the investment of the additional freeholding proceeds.

**Gilbertson/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

Resource Management Charges, Part 4.10

21. Includes small structures consents, and reduces the fixed fee from \$500 to \$200 on Table 1, Row 7, Part 4.10.

**Rose/McGregor
CARRIED**

Resource Management Charges, Transfer of a Resource Consent

22. Inserts in the additional charge column in Table 1, Column 3, Rows 8 & 9, Part 4.10: *“Based on actual and reasonable costs for non-standard process”*.

**McGregor/Rose
CARRIED**

Councillors von Dadelszen and Scott declared an interest in the following, and did not vote.

Resource Management Charges, Rates and Mileage for Hearing Committee

23. Changes rates to \$80.00 and \$100.00 per hour for members and chairs respectively, as well as mileage rate for \$.74c per km for related travel allowances to reflect current Remuneration Authority rates.

**Rose/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

The meeting adjourned at 5pm and reconvened on 9am on Tuesday 12 June 2012.

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE REGIONAL COUNCIL

Date: Tuesday 12 June 2012
Time: 9.00am
Venue: Council Chamber
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
NAPIER

Present: A J Dick
T Gilbertson
N Kirton
E McGregor
L Remmerswaal
K Rose
C Scott
E von Dadelszen
F Wilson - Chairman

In Attendance: A Newman – Chief Executive
M Mohi – Chairman – Maori Committee
L Hooper – Governance & Corporate Administration Manager
EA Lambert – Group Manager External Relations
M Adye – Group Manager Asset Management & Biosecurity

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mayor Lawrence Yule and Mr Ross McLeod on behalf of Hastings District Council, submitter number 114, • supported water storage and hill country afforestation projects and the early increase of the Heretaunga Plains flood protection scheme in particular. • Supported investigations into the market opportunities (value) for GMO free (field trials only) and is going to host a forum. • supported targeted rate for CDEM, and gearing of the Investment Strategy to invest in Hawke's Bay to benefit Hawke's Bay. • asked Council to contribute 2M to the Regional Sports Park for a tier 1 hockey turf and \$500k to Te Mata Park Visitor Centre from the Community Facilities fund.

Mr Bernie Gunn, submitter number 126, • agreed in principle to the shift in focus of the Regional Landcare Scheme, and believes widespread riparian management could achieve significant water quality gains. Key to promote benefits of better land management practices – maybe through model farms. Supported promotion of UMF Manuka as an alternative planting option for erosion prone land. • requested Biodiversity Strategy be developed more quickly than the 3 years, and supported this much needed work.

Ms Phyllis Tichinin, submitter number 131, • supported proposed Afforestation programme however sought a bigger programme that makes it easier for farmers to do it, including more dedicated staff and possibly planting crews. • Fast track the Biodiversity Strategy. • Advised not to underestimate negative impacts of water augmentation projects on the environment, • extreme caution to be exercised in assessment of applications for oil and gas production processes such as hydraulic fracturing.

Ms Sarah Millington, submitter number **132**, • supported Council's work. • Asked to slow the process of the feasibility study for RP water storage to be sure all of the information is available to make a good environmental decision in relation to land use intensification and water quality. • suggested afforestation should encourage indigenous vegetation rather than farm forestry (pinus radiata). • Reinvest profits from carbon credits directly into ecosystem protection programmes.

Mr Pete McIntosh on behalf of HB Fish and Game, submitter number **130**, • supported Afforestation but could be more effective if extended to include riparian planting. • timeframe for development of Biodiversity Strategy needs to be shortened by putting more funds into external resources. • concerned about land use intensification and non point source pollution discharges related to water storage project. • Fish & Game and iwi applied for Water Conservation Order for Ngaruroro River.

Mr Mohi arrived at 9.55am.

Councillor Dick left the meeting at 10am, and Councillor Gilbertson arrived at 10.05am.

Mr Des Ratima on behalf of Te Roopu Kaitaki O Te WaiMaori, submitter number **103**, • supported **Te Taiao Hawke's Bay Environment Forum, submission 191**, and offered the indigenous perspective. • noted no specific reference in the Plan to cultural values and asked that the omission be corrected. • Believes water storage would change a public asset to a private one – being access to the water. • Advised there are clear guidelines within the proposed National Policy Statement on Indigenous Biodiversity (January 2011) that would be valuable for Councillors to know.

Mr Robin Gwynn, submitter number **63**, • requested that Council submit to Central Government in opposition to the Trans Pacific Partnership Agreement • asked that further public consultation be undertaken prior to any decision being made on whether the Ruataniwha Plains water storage project is feasible • supported retaining 100% ownership of the Port of Napier Limited • Believes it should be Council's strategic priority to maintain the Napier-Gisborne rail link, even to the extent of investing • Supported Hawke's Bay being GMO Free • Opposed UAG for Civil Defence • all new buildings should be built with solar technology • Supported research alliance with Massey University.

The meeting adjourned at 1025am and reconvened at 1045am

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mr Brett Gilmore on behalf of Pan Pac Forest Products Ltd and HB Forestry Group, submitter numbers **10 and 11**, • overall supported projects proposed in the Plan, particularly afforestation on highly erodible hill country and the Regional Pest Management Strategy. • Pleased to see progress on development of the biodiversity Strategy however feels there should be more emphasis on contributions of private landowners and more funding allocated. • Does not support GMO Free Hawke's Bay as a 'brand' (marketing exercise) and feels debate needs to evolve over the next decade, including discussions around possible unintended consequences such as pathogens.

Mr John Warren, submitter number **35**, • fully supported the concept of resilience the Plan is based upon • sought assurance that resilient ecosystems given highest priority or ranking. • Believes Council plays important part in reducing greenhouse gas emissions • asked that Council set goals for emission reductions in the Region.

Mr Neil Eagles on behalf of Forest & Bird Napier, submitter number **17 and 127**, • supported Council implementation of the NPS for Freshwater • suggested

regulations are put in place to protect the environment from the effects of farming.
• more resource needs to be put into developing the Biodiversity Strategy.

Mr Xan Harding on behalf of HB Winegrowers Association Inc, submitter number **147**,
• sees conflict for Council in development of the water storage project as both owner and regulator.
• allocation limits have massive implications for growers and those impacts haven't been sufficiently considered.
• Stringent cost-benefit analysis needs to be done prior to bringing in requirements for meters on all takes, regardless of the amount taken, in some catchments.
• wants Council to put more resource into water meter bulk buying proposals.
• Looks to Council as regulator to resolve and help prevent spray drift.
• Concerned GMO Free status could negatively affect research.

Councillor Dick re-joined the meeting at 11.30am.

Mr Mike Connor, submitter number **135**, • suggested environmental benchmarking be used, and more field monitoring be carried out as opposed to computer modelling.
• questions about Ruataniwha water storage but satisfied that various studies will answer all of those before Council makes a decision to proceed or not.
• Supported the stakeholder, user group method of consultation.

Mr Dean Hulls, submitter number **202**, • supported proposal for additional hockey turf at the Regional Sports Park, • 55% of the player base is in Hastings and CHB. • less expensive to build in Hastings than to re-develop Napier to include a Tier 1 turf.

Ms Dianne Vesty on behalf of HB Fruitgrowers Association Inc, submitter number **143**,
• concerned about biosecurity • requested that Council direct resources to development of Invertebrates Biosecurity Strategy. • Supported targeted rate for enhancement of the Raupare Stream. • national regulations in place for GMO are sufficient • concerned GMO free could have negative consequences for research.

Mrs Margaret Gwynn, submitter number **621**, • concerns surrounding Ruataniwha Plains water storage project including land use intensification. • Asked that applications for hydraulic fracturing be publicly notified. • Asked that Council write to the government seeking assurance that water will remain in the control of New Zealand and New Zealanders. • Opposed to Trans Pacific Partnership Agreement.

4. STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Ms Lambert advised that amendments to figures and notes in the Resource Management Charges section of the LTP were the result of staff proofreading to ensure the clarity and consistency of the charges and how they would be applied.

RC4/12

Resolutions

That Council

Resource Management Charges, Fixed Charges for Resource Consent Applications Requiring Notification or a Hearing

24. Changes heading in Table 1a, Part 4.10 (Page 52) to read:

“Table 1a: Fixed Charges for Resource Consent Applications Requiring Notification or a Hearing.”

**Rose/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

Resource Management Charges, Zone Based Water Science Charges

25. Inserts the additional wording in point 3, third paragraph, in Part 4.10 under Allocation of charges: *“The Hawke’s Bay Regional Council will be excluded from these charges”*.

**Gilbertson/Scott
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

There was discussion of how resolutions might reflect Council’s intentions where the decision was to make no change to the plan but other follow-up actions such as further discussions were being suggested. It was noted that the letters advising Council’s decisions would, in many cases, be personalised and include explanations of further actions or legislative requirements and the like.

The meeting adjourned at 1230pm and reconvened at 1pm.

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mayors Barbara Arnott and Lawrence Yule, submitter number **49**, • requested dialogue about using an occupancy or bed tax to pay for tourism as an alternative to a rates charge. • see the Regional Council as the collector of funds to pay for Tourism HB and believe it’s time that the principle benefactors of tourism activities (in this case accommodation providers) pay rather than ratepayers. • HB Tourism is and will continue to be successful.

Mrs Ann Redstone, submitter number **9**, • concerned about gravel extraction from the Tukituki River contributing to erosion issues along the Cape Coast. • Suggested those extracting gravel, i.e. Awatoto, should pay for mitigation measures such as groynes along the coast south of their operation.

Mr Keith Newman on behalf of Walking on Water (WOW) Inc, submitter number **37**, • asked HBRC to participate in a working party to find a suitable, affordable solution for coastal erosion of the Cape coast.

Mr Mark Lawrence, submitter number **38**, • stated 30 million m³ of gravel missing from the Cape Coast beach and residents want to know where it has gone. • Concerned that Ruataniwha storage dam will stop the flow of gravel down the river. • mining of gravel at Awatoto is the cause of the erosion problems at Te Awanga/Haumoana.

Mr Rod Heaps, submitter number **111**, • requested that HBRC assist with the Clifton Reserve Society’s efforts to protect Clifton Beach from further erosion by way of financially contributing to resource consent application processes. • further justified by siting of the closest rescue boat launch to Cape Kidnappers.

Ms Raewyn Nelson, submitter number **44**, • supported GMO Free region, a ‘frack’ free region and solar and photovoltaic power. • farmers and others should be made to pay for breaches affecting water quality. • Opposed to corporate wind farms as individual households should be encouraged to be self sufficient and not have to rely on commercial power generators. • Opposed to the Ruataniwha Plains and Ngaruroro water storage projects, even if they are ‘community owned’.

Ms Sandra Cordell on behalf of Fonterra, submitter number **149**, Dairy Farmer and Fonterra Shareholder Councillor for this Ward, • supported Council’s steps toward assuring water security for producers through Ruataniwha Plains water storage. • Noted community projects that Fonterra is involved in, including the Milk in Schools project. • look forward to working with Council to improve water quality, and supportive of work being done in pest management, particularly TBfree.

Mrs Angela Hair, Concordia Health, submitter number **152**, • supported continuation of the Clean Heat programme • Enviroschools funding and development of a Solar Hot Water scheme. • concerned about the threat of contamination of the region’s water

from hydraulic fracturing • sought change to RRMP to make it a prohibited activity • any application to be publicly notified. • Asked that GMO crops be prohibited through the RRMP. • Questioned decision making process around the Ruataniwha Plains water storage project with the conflict if Council is owner and regulator. • Advocate for the decision of whether to proceed being made by Investment Company rather than Council.

Ms Sharleen Baird, submitter number 174, • concerned about Ruataniwha Plains water storage project. • RMA regulatory framework not working and self regulation (i.e. Fonterra's Clean Streams Accord) has failed. • Penalties should include measures such as limiting water supply. • public-private ownership model does not work. • Suggested bondholding as a possible funding / investment model. • Supported retaining 100% PONL ownership, Council webcasting meetings and pursuing GMO Free options for Hawke's Bay.

Mr Grenville Christie, submitter number 175, • long term protection of the environment and biodiversity should be Council's focus. • Concerned about Cadmium soil contamination from the use of super-phosphates. • if a dam is built in CHB Council must own it to protect it from being sold to foreign investors. • Clean Streams Accord inadequate.

4. **STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Councillors sought clarification in relation to charges for multiple bore permits, which was provided by Ms Emma O'Neill.

Ms Lambert advised that the amendments to the figures for onsite wastewater monitoring charges were to correct errors discovered through proofreading.

RC5/12

Resolutions

That Council:

Resource Management Charges, Bore Permit Deposits – Multiple Bore Permits

26. Changes Table 1 (page 51) to read:

“Other consent applications (where three or more bores are to be drilled for the same purpose on the same site [or in close proximity] an application can be made for a bore field consent with a deposit of \$1000) where the purpose is for environmental monitoring.”

26.1 Amends Note 1 to “... actual disbursements (as in Table 6)”.

26.2 Adds new footnote which reads:

“Note 3: Where a bore field consent is issued for three or more bores for the purpose of environmental monitoring, bore inspection and compliance administration shall be carried out at a rate of \$97 per hour.”

**von Dadelzen/Scott
CARRIED**

Resource Management Charges, Monitoring of Domestic On-Site Wastewater Treatment Systems

27. Amends Part 4.10, Table 2a (fourth box down) from “\$329” to “\$340”.

28. Amends Part 4.10, first paragraph, fourth line, under Monitoring of Domestic On-site Wastewater Treatment Systems Charges from “\$329” to “\$340.”

**Rose/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

4. STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Ms Gilbertson explained that the Regional Transport Committee requested provision be made in year 4 (2015/16) of the LTP for \$200,000 for the construction of a stock effluent facility north of Napier, between Napier and Wairoa, and \$5000 per annum for maintenance of the facility in years 4 to 10 of the LTP. This is provisional only, and a decision will be made to proceed or not, depending on site location being available, cost, consenting issues etc, being investigated by NZTA in 2012/13

RC6/12 Resolution

That Council

29. Approves the provision in project 797 of \$200,000 for year 2015/16 for the construction of a stock effluent facility between Napier and Wairoa and the provision in years 4 to 10 of \$5000 to cover maintenance of this facility, to be funded from general rates.

**Rose/Dick
CARRIED**

The meeting adjourned at 3pm and reconvened at 3.15pm

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Ms Marie Taylor, submitter number 145, • pleased to see inclusion of Biodiversity Inventory and Strategy programmed in LTP as sees it as crucial. • believes more funding needs to be directed at getting the strategy done as quickly as possible to protect what little biodiversity remains. • Following the inventory, the strategy should underpin all further policy development and plan changes.

Mr Terry Kelly, submitter number 189, • supported previous submissions advocating for accelerating Biodiversity Strategy development. • some 'good stuff' in the LTP and underlying principles are good. • Asked that relationships between Council's goals be clarified for people, • sought prioritisation of the environment as the one element that won't be compromised.

Dr Nicholas Jones, submitter number 118, • DHB believes that Health Equality should be included as a regional community outcome. • health impact study should be carried out as part of the Ruataniwha Plains water storage feasibility studies. • Asked that health impacts of hydraulic fracturing be included in considerations for any regulatory and/or policy mechanisms to be included in changes to the RRMP.

Ms Diane Charteris, submitter number 159, • supported managed retreat solution for communities threatened by coastal erosion except where significant infrastructure such as road and rail is threatened. • Opposed hydraulic fracturing in oil and gas exploration due to long term costs of contamination.

Mr Simon Lusk on behalf of Friends of the Tukituki, submitter number 120, • the group sees its role as one of insuring that CHB meets wastewater discharge consent conditions, • more public consultation on the Tukituki plan change required.

RC7/12 Resolution

30. That pursuant to Model Standing Orders 3.3.7, Council agrees to continue the meeting past the six-hour limit.

**von Dadelszen/Dick
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mr Chris Perley on behalf of Sustaining Hawke's Bay Trust, submitter number 182,
• economy dependent on society, which is dependent on environment. • Opposed to loss of investment and effort in the wider landscape of the regional landcare scheme.
• Opposed encouraging high energy industrial commodity agriculture through the refocus of the RLS. • timeline for biodiversity strategy to be brought forward to 18 months, • include landscape ecological function, ecosystem services and nutrition reproduction recruitment and distribution in the strategy. • asked that Ruataniwha water storage project be withdrawn from the LTP as insufficient information available.
• Supported Hawke's Bay GMO Free declaration, Heat Smart, Solar Hot water and public transport initiatives. • Hill country afforestation project is risky. • Supported transfer of Tutira properties as part of an integrated, multifunctional plan linking the properties of the area together.

Mr Bruno Chambers on behalf of the Te Mata Park Trust, submitter number 117,
• sought funding assistance for the development of Te Mata Park Visitor Centre. A series of reports supporting the business case have been completed and a cultural impact report is underway. A resource consent application is ready to be lodged.

Ms Dionne Thomas, on behalf of the Clifton Reserve Society, submitter number 80,
• sought Council's assistance to protect the Reserve from further erosion • provided 4 options for achieving this. • indicative price for option 3 is \$250k.

The meeting adjourned at 4.55pm and reconvened at 9am on Wednesday 13 June 2012.

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE REGIONAL COUNCIL

Date: Wednesday 13 June 2012
Time: 9.00am
Venue: Council Chamber
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
NAPIER

Present: A J Dick
T Gilbertson
N Kirton
E McGregor
L Remmerswaal
K Rose
C Scott
E von Dadelszen
F Wilson - Chairman

In Attendance: A Newman – Chief Executive
M Mohi – Chairman – Maori Committee
L Hooper – Governance & Corporate Administration Manager
EA Lambert – Group Manager External Relations
M Adye – Group Manager Asset Management & Biosecurity

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Tessa Tylee, Claire McCormack and Gillie Lawrence on behalf of Film Hawke's Bay Trust, submitter number **138**, • sought funding assistance for marketing.

Mike Halliday, Chris Ryan and David Allan on behalf of Guthrie Smith Trust, submitter number **153**, • the work of the Trust in biodiversity protection and environmental education aligns with Council's activities • requested further development of partnership with Council. • sought funding assistance of \$25,000 per year over the next 10 years, although not specified in the written submission.

Mr Chris Ryan, submitter number **31**, • monoculture to be avoided in the region, • advocated for an integrated catchment plan for afforestation and biodiversity, based on soil science and sustainable in the long term. • Supported the use of demonstration areas for riparian planting and other land management initiatives. • Protection of the region's natural assets should be Council's focus. • NPS for Biodiversity represents 'work already done' and Council should use that as the basis for its Strategy.

Mr Iain Taylor on behalf of Hawke's Bay Hockey, submitter number **234**, • supported development of tier 1 hockey turf at the Regional Sports Park. • Geographic need for additional facilities, not at Park Island. • supported the addition of a third turf at Park Island as well.

Mr Ian Francis on behalf of Hockey New Zealand, submitter number **204**, • supported Regional Sports Park application for funding to build a tier 1 hockey turf at the Park.

Mr Neil Edmundson and Mr Guy Wellwood on behalf of Hawke's Bay Hockey Artificial Surface Trust, submitter number **226**, • opposed to proposal to build a tier 1 hockey turf at the Regional Sports Park. • Supplementary turfs to provide more access for junior hockey are in Hastings however Park Island should remain (is already) the Regional hub with 'spokes' in Hastings and elsewhere.

Mr Jock Mackintosh on behalf of Sports Park Hawke's Bay, submitter number **200**, • unanimous agreement that an additional turf required in Hastings. • decision on proceeding with tier 1 turf at the Regional Sports Park dependent on multi-year financial agreement being signed with Hockey New Zealand. • development nationally significant for hockey.

Mr Dan Bloomer, LandWISE Inc, submitter number **119**, • supported general intent expressed in LTP document, Heretaunga Plains Urban Development strategy • encouraged Council to continue implementing HPUDS into policy and planning documents. • additional funding for community led initiatives would allow those groups to better focus on the work rather than fundraising.

The meeting adjourned at 1030am and reconvened at 1050am.

Mr Mike Halliday, submitter number **128**, • suggested Council needs to be sure of the long term objective for the erosion prone hill country and avoid trying to use a short term investment in carbon to fix it. • using short rotation species will not be as effective as using long rotation species. • Supported separation of the Afforestation proposal from the Regional Landcare Scheme, however suggested Council consider an obligation for landowners for permanence of the plantings.

Julianna Dawson on behalf of North Clyde in Focus, submitter number **107**, • environmental issues from large scale industrial operations impacting on the community. • group formed to take their issues forward for resolution. Councillors advised Ms Dawson of several options for pursuing solutions to the community's issues, including HBRC's environmental monitoring and compliance team.

Mr Peter Moore, submitter number **78**, • opposed to increasing level of flood protection as cannot 'predict' climate change impacts. • 1 water meter, should have 1 charge, no matter how many consents • the way section 36 charges are applied needs to change accordingly. • calculation of the charges incorrectly reported and applied.

Pauline Elliott, submitter number **160**, • accepted the staff response in relation to the sell down of Port of Napier shares, • asked that the special consultative process, should this proposal eventuate, be more transparent than the previous consultation on establishing the Investment Company. • Requested that an explanation of how ratepayers will be involved in future investment decisions be included in appropriate plans. • Requested that Council's communication plan relating to the decision whether the Ruataniwha dam project is feasible be included in LTP. • Asked what provisions could be included in the LTP or other plans and policies that would allow for consent applications for any new activities like hydraulic fracturing to be held or not accepted until independent research became available.

Mr Barry Ridler, submitter number **113**, • believes the costs for the water storage dam are now too high for farmers to afford. • Expects careful explanation of the reasons, risk and likely reward from any spending of ratepayer money to all ratepayers.

Mr Douglas Lloyd Jenkins on behalf of HB Museum and Art Gallery, submitter number **170**, • sought \$322,600 per year funding assistance for operations to increase the level of service provided by the HB Regional Archives.

Mr Andrew Wilson, submitter number **186**, • impossible to form an informed view on the water storage project because of a lack of information. • believes the project is not viable.

Mr Paul Bailey, submitter number **4**, • concerned about the environmental impacts of land use intensification and increasing costs for the Ruataniwha Plains water storage scheme. • if viable, the dam should be funded by farmers and private investment.

Ms Maria van Dien, submitter number **115**, • requested that any consent for hydraulic fracturing (HF) not be processed until the PCE investigation is completed. • Accepted that rules and policies regulating HF cannot be addressed through the LTP process • appreciated the staff's informative, professional response to the submissions. • Encouraged investment in improving freshwater quality. • Asked – how can this improve the water quality of the Tukituki River? - be a pivotal question in the Ruataniwha Plains water storage feasibility.

Mr John Bostock on behalf of Pure Hawke's Bay, submitter number **14**, • asked HBRC to take all necessary steps to secure GM Free food producing status for the region.

The meeting adjourned at 12.40pm and reconvened at 1pm.

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Setha Davenport, submitter number **197**, • asked that Council publicly declare Hawke's Bay GM Free and make related policy changes to regulate against the use of GM field trials in the region. • Asked that funding be included in LTP to fund plan changes to ensure a Frack Free Hawke's Bay. • Supported afforestation if biodiversity enhancement, permanent carbon sinks, soil conservation and sustainable timber production are included. • Opposed to large scale water storage projects.

Brent Linn on behalf of HB A & P Society, submitter number **137**, • spoke about the alignment between what the Society does and the activities of Council. • Showgrounds has a place and role to play in economic development for the region, • requested funding for facilities development.

Mr Dennis Mitchell and Mr Matthew Hall on behalf of TB Free New Zealand, submitters number **1 and 2**, • thanked Council for ongoing support • introduced their new strategy aimed at eradicating TB from the wildlife population.

Ms Sally Jackson on behalf of the Art Deco Trust, submitter number **146**, • requested funding assistance to move to new location at 7 Tennyson Street.

Mr Marei Apatu on behalf of Te Taiwhenua o Heretaunga, submitter number **77**, • expressed desire for TToH to continue partnership with Council and the Maori community with continued Council funding assistance.

Napier Motel Association, represented by Tim Stephens, submitter number **32**, spoke about the decline in the number of guest arrivals in Napier.

Ms Anne Waapu, submitter number **227**, • supported development of a hockey turf at the Regional Sports Park • tier 1 turf would inspire more people to participate in hockey.

Mr Mac Kirkwood on behalf of the Karamu Enhancement Group, submitter number **36**, • concerned about stock in streams • asked that Council develop policies and rules to address the issue. • Concerned 'baseline' inventory of the region's biodiversity. • targeted rate to fund the Heat Smart should not be applied to all ratepayers, but provide an exemption for those who already use clean heat sources. • Requested voting rights at Council for the Chairman of the Maori Committee.

4. **STAFF INTERNAL SUBMISSION TO THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Mr Adye advised that a Hearing Panel convened on 29 May 2012, heard submissions on the proposed Kairakau Community Scheme, and recommended introduction of the scheme for adoption by the Regional Council on 27 June.

RC8/12 **Resolution**

That Council

31. Makes provision for the establishment of the Kairakau Community Scheme, to be funded from a targeted rate of \$100 + GST per annum, per residential property commencing in the 2012/13 year, with a contribution of \$800 from Council general funding sources, subject to Council's adoption of the Kairakau Hearings Panel recommendations at its meeting on 27 June 2012.

**von Dadelszen/McGregor
CARRIED**

3. **SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Mrs Lambert provided Councillors with a set of recommendations, aligned with the staff responses, to use as the basis for decision making on the submissions.

The meeting adjourned at 3pm and reconvened at 320pm.

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Mr Bruce Wills on behalf of Federated Farmers, submitter number **192**, • personal strong support for the Ruataniwha Plains water storage project. • Congratulated Council for the fair and reasonable rates it had set. • afforestation project a tool for dealing with climate change and building resilience on farms.

Pauline Tangiora, submitter number **30**, • supported more defined policies in relation to Maori participation. • Requested a precautionary approach to processing hydraulic fracturing consents. • Maori committee Chairman should have a vote at Council meetings.

Kerry Babbage on behalf of MATES Trust NZ, submitter number **161**, • requested that a video about the organization be played, however the Council's firewall would not allow access. The Trust requested \$30,000 per annum for the next ten years, to assist in delivery of programmes targeted at preventing male suicides in the HB community.

3. **SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22**

Council commenced deliberations on the public submissions received on the Long Term Plan.

Mr Adye provided Councillors with background information relating to the proposed Afforestation project and decision making points. A number of the submissions relating to afforestation expressed the desire for this project to include environmental outcomes relating to biodiversity. Noted that the concerns and suggestions made via submissions would be addressed through the development of the operational plan to be considered by Council later in the year.

RC9/12 **Resolution**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Hill Country Afforestation, and:

3. Confirms the inclusion of the provision to spend \$47 million in the 2012-22 period as investment into hill country afforestation subject to Council approval of an operational plan, and a carbon trading strategy and policy for the project by September 2012. The operational plan will address the suitability of species, silviculture regimes, grant rates and the balance of carbon and wood values, and site suitability to achieve the environmental values. The operational plan will be reviewed annually.

**Scott/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

A number of the submissions relating to the Regional Landcare Scheme supported the continuation and refocussing of the scheme. Councillors consider the RLS a valuable tool to help achieve better land use practices, but want it refocussed to be more effective.

RC10/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Regional Landcare Scheme, and:

4. Maintains its funding for the Regional Landcare Scheme at \$880,000 per annum and requests that staff report back to Council on a detailed proposal to more effectively align the Regional Landcare Scheme for:
 - 4.1 HBRC's environmental protection priorities and the region's most sensitive natural habitats
 - 4.2 Areas where land use intensification is most likely to occur and where it poses the greatest risk to soil and water quality
 - 4.3 Achieving greater integration with the HBRC's afforestation and riparian projects
 - 4.4 Supporting biodiversity strategies in the Region
 - 4.5 The Ruataniwha feasibility project has spent \$435,000 on land use intensification impacts and mitigation measures and that this information will guide the RLS scheme. Additionally the RWS has assessed terrestrial biodiversity impacts and in-stream aquatic ecology, all of which is relevant in informing priorities for the RLS.

**McGregor/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

An alliance with DoC, and other Councils, could offer an opportunity to tap into biodiversity expertise from other organisations to contribute to development of the strategy. Thinking around the development of the strategy from a science perspective was more in the area of developing an inventory of what is within the region. The costs in the LTP are for external work to complete the inventory. The planning and strategy work (project 192) was not reflected in the LTP. The inventory is already under way but in order to bring forward completion would require significant additional resource. Several submitters expressed the desire for the strategy to be accelerated.

Councillors, through discussion, agreed that the programme should be accelerated and suggested putting more resource toward the project up front as a means of achieving the inventory in the next 18 months rather than the proposed 3 years. The source for this additional initial funding needs to be identified.

RC11/12

Resolutions

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Regional Biodiversity Strategy, and:

5. Confirms funding for the development of a regional biodiversity inventory and strategy, this being \$87,500 in Year 2102/13 and \$15,500 in Year 2013/14.

**Kirton/Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

6. That Council receives the submissions from Dianne Vesty on behalf of HB Fruitgrowers' Association (143) and Xan Harding on behalf of HB Winegrowers' Association (147) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Most submissions were supportive of the Heat Smart programme as a means of improving winter air quality in the airsheds as well as improving insulation and heating in homes, and Councillors confirmed that the benefits to the community were sufficient to continue with the project.

Resolution

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Heat Smart, and:

7. continues funding of the Heat Smart programme using existing interest rate subsidies (50% for clean heat) and the current level of grants for clean heat (\$700); with a review of these to occur in 2014/15.

**Rose/Scott
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

The Mayors submitted (number 49) in favour of implementing a bed tax of sorts to fund Tourism activities in the region instead of using a rate. Councillors discussed other means of 'beneficiary pays' being used to fund the Strategy and suggested that those beneficiaries are not limited to accommodation providers and should include Event venues amongst others.

RC12/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submission from Mayors Barbara Arnott (Napier City) and Lawrence Yule (Hastings District) and the staff comments and:

8. Does not introduce a bed tax for funding the Regional Events Strategy but continues to explore, with the Mayors, rating options including targeted contributions from beneficiaries such as accommodation providers and event venues.

**Scott/Rose
CARRIED**

9. That pursuant to Model Standing Orders 3.3.7, Council agrees to continue the meeting past the six-hour limit.

**von Dadeslzen/Kirton
CARRIED**

The meeting adjourned at 5pm and reconvened at 5.30pm.

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Three key criteria that projects need to meet for the Community Facilities Fund are: the value of the project; the percentage of contribution from this Council; the support of the related Local Territorial Authority. It was noted that the Te Mata Peak project may appear to be better aligned to Council's policy than the Sports Park.

There was discussion about whether the hockey turf at Hastings would be a truly Regional facility or whether the facility at Park Island would continue to serve that purpose.

The point was made that of the \$3M available from the fund, \$2.1M is proposed to be funded from loans.

RC13/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Community Facilities Funding, and:

10. Expends the remaining funds in the Regional Communities Facilities Fund as follows:

- 10.1 \$500,000 for the upgrade of the Wairoa Community Centre/ Alexander Park in Wairoa District

**Scott/Rose
CARRIED**

- 10.2 \$500,000 for the provision of a Visitor and Education Centre at Te Mata Peak in Hastings District, subject to negotiations with the Te Mata Park Trust and the Hastings District Council to ensure the best possible alignment with the Regional Council's policy for Community Facilities and brand recognition.

**von Dadelszen/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

- 10.3 \$2M provision is made for regional hockey turf facilities in Hawke's Bay, requiring that the HB Hockey Association, Artificial Surfaces Trust, Regional Sports Park Trust and the Napier City and Hastings District councils, produce an acceptable and agreed Plan for any new Regional hockey turf facilities that complies with council's Regional Community Facilities fund policy.

Kirton/Dick

Councillor McGregor proposed an amendment to recommendation 9.3, seconded by councillor von Dadelszen to:

Substitute the words "in Hawke's Bay" with... at the Regional Sports Park ...

The amendment, when put, was lost.

Councillor Rose proposed an amendment to recommendation 10.3, seconded by Councillor McGregor, by adding:

The HBRC believes that the funding is made available for facilities within the Hastings District council area.

The amendment, when put, was lost.

The original motion therefore became the substantive motion.

- 10.3 \$2M provision is made for regional hockey turf facilities in Hawke's Bay, requiring that the HB Hockey Association, the Hawke's Bay Hockey Artificial Surfaces Trust, the Regional Sports Park Trust and the Napier City and Hastings District councils, produce an acceptable and agreed Plan for any new Regional hockey turf facilities that complies with Council's Regional Community Facilities fund policy.

Kirton/Dick

For: Dick, McGregor, Scott, Rose, von Dadelszen, Kirton, Wilson

Against: Remmerswaal, Gilbertson

CARRIED AS THE SUBSTANTIVE MOTION

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Submitters were both supportive and wary of the water storage projects. Some submitters were unaware of the results of the pre-feasibility studies and the reasons for identifying a single dam site, and were concerned that until they had the opportunity to view all studies they could not support the proposal. It was noted that no decision will be made until completion of the feasibility study.

RC14/12 Resolutions

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Ruataniwha Plains Water Storage Project, and:

11. Makes a provision of \$80M for an equity stake in the Ruataniwha Water Storage infrastructure project. The final decision to invest will be subject to decisions as follows.
 - 11.1 the project is recommended as being commercially feasible by the Hawke's Bay Regional Investment Company and clearly meets the Council's environmental objectives
 - 11.2 Council has approved feasibility and undertakes further consultation with the community before proceeding
 - 11.3 the project is consented, and the project is bankable as demonstrated by the financial commitment from other investment partners compatible with HBRIC.

Scott/Rose

CARRIED

The meeting adjourned at 7.20pm on Wednesday 13 June and reconvened at 9am on Thursday 14 June 2012.

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE REGIONAL COUNCIL

Date: Thursday 14 June 2012
Time: 9.00am
Venue: Council Chamber
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
NAPIER

Present: A J Dick
T Gilbertson
N Kirton (*from 12.20pm onward*)
E McGregor
L Remmerswaal
K Rose
C Scott
E von Dadelszen
F Wilson - Chairman

In Attendance: M Mohi – Chairman – Maori Committee (*from 10.20am onward*)
A Newman – Chief Executive
EA Lambert – Group Manager External Relations
L Hooper – Governance & Corporate Administration Manager
P Drury – Group Manager Corporate Services
I Maxwell – Group Manager Resource Management

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting.

It was noted that Councillor Kirton and Mr Mohi were not present.

Councillor Remmerswaal declared an interest in submissions related to hydraulic fracturing and will not vote on related decisions.

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions on the subject of hydraulic fracturing from submitters.

Helen Yensen, submitter number **637**, • felt councillors not well served by staff on this topic, • expected staff to have created a portfolio of sorts containing a compilation of all related research reports on Hydraulic Fracturing (HF) for councillors and the public to access. • from her research on the topic, the long term, irreversible adverse effects on the environment require prohibition of the HF process.

Richard Marshall, submitter number **613**, • accepted Council limited in what they are able to do in the absence of any resource consent applications • understood there are rules and policies within the Regional Resource Management Plan to regulate the activities involved in oil and gas exploration and production. • Expressed his desire for Council to make information available to the public on the HF process and the risks associated. • explained how the HF process works • believes that oil company representatives cannot be trusted and try to hide the detrimental effects of their

activities. • Concerned that Tag Apache could become financially involved in Ruataniwha Plains water storage project.

Richard Ryan, submitter number **347**, • Council's role in safeguarding the environment to protect the water resource against contamination for economic gain. • environmental damage will be irreversible. • HF not safe this close to tectonic plate.

Charmaine Wilson, submitter number **577**, • played a video of an interview with a doctor about the health effects of radioactivity associated with shale gas production.

Filipa Hope, submitter number **460**, • asked that the community be educated about the risks of HF. • mineral resource exploration poses unacceptable risks to the primary production sector. • long term sustainability the key economic consideration in the LTP. • Asked that Council sets aside \$50k annually for changes to plans/policies to regulate exploration activities. • Make HF a prohibited activity.

Mr Pat Mawson, submitter number **612**, • risks of shale gas exploration • asked that Council does everything it can to protect the environment and the community. • Sought Council's assurance that staff would have access to sufficient information and expertise to enable them to assess any applications for HF.

Marie Dunningham on behalf of Grey Power Hastings & Napier, submitter number **615**, • requested that all applications for HF be publicly notified. • Requested more (independent and not provided by the industry) evidence, time and information be provided to staff before any decisions are made to grant consents for HF.

Point of order was raised by Councillor Dick, which was upheld by the Chairman who warned the speaker against denigrating staff.

Michael Francis, submitter number **493**, • risks of HF contaminating fresh water are high and non disclosure agreements have prevented the full effects of environmental and health damage being made public in Australia. • Suggested bonding be used as a means of ensuring companies take financial responsibility for any damage caused.

Mr Mohi arrived at 1020am.

Paddy Cooper, submitter number **543**, • HB could not be compared to Taranaki, • if illegal to discharge diesel then discharging of chemicals used in HF should not be permitted. • no risks associated with HF are acceptable. • Asked that HB be declared Frack Free.

The meeting adjourned at 1030am and reconvened at 1050am

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Jane Smart, submitter number **319**, • asked Council to change RPS to declare Hydraulic Fracturing (HF) a prohibited activity and rules in the RRMP to regulate oil/gas/mineral exploration. • Asked that HBRC oppose applications to EPA for HF and provide \$50k annual funding to make necessary plan/policy changes. Chemicals used in HF pose threats to bio-organisms. • Add statements to the Right Debate as per submission. • Quoted reports of evidence of water contamination and benzene causing blood disorders.

Barry Warren, submitter number **304**, • quoted from a testament 31 May 2012 by Robert Howarth, PhD, biochemist and ecosystem biologist and an expert on HF at US Congress, that raised concerns that a new combination of water and chemicals being used in HF • most shale gas production has only occurred in the last 3 years. • Central government agencies should have a central role in regulating HF.

Beate Bergdolt, submitter number **554**, • fears consequences of fracking accidents on the environment, the community's health and tourism. • Federal Government in Germany has banned fracking.

Councillor von Dadelszen left the meeting at 11.25am.

Kevin Simpson, submitter number **463**, • asked that pressure be put on Central Government.

The Chairman reiterated his warning to speakers that comments denigrating staff would result in being their asked to leave.

Kevin Simpson continued • despite staff statement that there are rules to regulate HF, there is nothing in RRMP to effectively manage the effects of HF. • Clear that questions need to be asked of the RMA. • Asked that same consideration be given to HF as GMO • adopt a precautionary approach and hold off processing any applications until PCE report is in • Suggested that Council needs to collect independent baseline data at each site where an application for HF is received.

Mr Angus Macdonald, submitter number **402**, • 3 points of concern. 1. Fear of known and unknown effects. 2 Allaying Fears. 3 Requested that a pre-emptive precautionary action of withholding consent be taken • applications for HF publicly notified. • Provide \$50k annually for required changes to RRMP.

Rochelle Howe, submitter number **498**, • asked that Council acknowledges adverse effects of HF are significant, and protects the community from the effects of shale gas exploration • \$50k annually toward changes to the RRMP. • drilling will be done en masse. • Increased number of wells increases environmental effects. • lots of industry hype doesn't stack up.

Helena Faust, submitter number **630**, • deeply concerned about detrimental health and environmental effects of HF. • Acknowledged much still unknown about the processes and its effects. • 362 chemicals used in HF, only 355 fully described in scientific terms. • Damage from spills irreversible. • Fluid migration is said to not be rare. • Methane concentrations found in drinking water up to 1km away. • Current methods of disposal of contaminated fracking water include spraying into the air to evaporate, storing in pits, spraying onto roads as de-icer, and sent to local sewerage treatment plants. Exemptions for the industry from the clean air and water acts in the US. Communities where fracking occurring seeking protection. • Asked for protection of the regional community from the effects of HF.

Barbara Bailey on behalf of Greg Hart, submitter number **368**, • acknowledge Council in a difficult position having to work within current laws, rules and policies. • Asked for RRMP changes to better regulate HF. • Applications not to be considered in isolation, but as a group so that cumulative effects can be assessed. • Requested a Plan Change be initiated.

Richard Gaddum on behalf of Roger Millward, submitter number **478**, • effects of HF on farmers in the US and Australia. • Some from the industry now speaking out publicly against HF. • farmers don't realise the implications of signing agreements (easements) with gas companies.

Councillor Kirton arrived at 12.20pm.

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Ken Keys, submitter number **461**, • believes that staff must inform themselves and take a position on HF. • Asked where the guardianship is. • Evidence of industry falsifying reports. • Mountain of overseas evidence of harmful effects. • Recognise critical importance of the aquifer.

The meeting adjourned at 12.25pm and reconvened at 1pm.

Council recommenced hearing verbal submissions from submitters.

Brian Mangin, submitter number **638**, • reiterated the requests for more information to be made publicly available • expressed concern about the breakdown of communities. • Reiterated requests for HF to be made a prohibited activity • undertake plan changes • NZ should look at overseas regulation and then develop their own.

Pauline Doyle, submitter number **622**, • anything that impacts on the environment in Hawke's Bay is the concern of Council. • Pointed out the oil/gas industry cannot be trusted to accurately report the negative impacts of the processes associated with oil and gas exploration and production.

Staff were asked whether Council is in a position to declare HB a Frack Free Region. In the view of staff, even a declaration of 'Frack Free' would not stop resource consents being lodged for that activity as under the RMA applicants would still have the right to do so. GMO activities are not covered by Council's regulatory framework, however the activities associated with HF are. Council captures regulation of HF under their responsibilities related to the allocation of and discharges to water, air and land and relevant policies and rules in the RRMP.

The PCE report is expected toward the end of October. As well as requesting the PCE study, Council has initiated a GAP analysis and is in discussions with MED in this regard. Staff are also investigating making submissions on various pieces of related legislation that are under review, and had read the HSE (Petroleum Exploration and Extraction) Regulations 1999 but not submitted directly because they supported the views put forward by other councils in their submissions.

Councillors agreed that there is significant public concern surrounding gas/oil exploration and hydraulic fracturing and noted that Council staff would be continuing their investigations into effective regulation of industry processes. Once the PCE report was complete, Council would then be in a position to assess what policy response might be necessary.

RC15/12 Councillor Remmerswaal declared an interest and therefore took no part in debate, nor voting.

Resolution

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Oil and Gas Exploration and Hydraulic Fracturing, and:

12. Amends the Right Debate section of the Long Term Plan to include:

"HBRC has heard the concerns of a number of its citizens and acknowledges the risk around the practice of hydraulic fracturing and has taken action to refer the matter to the Parliamentary Commissioner for the environment. Should the Commissioner's report include environmental effects that need addressing through the Regional Resource Management Plan then HBRC will undertake notifying the necessary plan changes."

**Scott/Dick
CARRIED**

Councillor Kirton proposed an amendment, which was seconded by Councillor Gilbertson, being to add:

HBRC values the protection of ecosystems in the region and recognises that mineral exploration/extraction poses long term risk to soil, water and ecosystems. HBRC will ensure all aspects of risk to soil, water and ecosystems are mitigated in each application for mineral exploration and extraction.

**Kirton/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

Councillor Dick proposed an amendment, which was seconded by Councillor Rose, being to add “avoided, remedied, or” ahead of “mitigated” in the last sentence.

**Dick/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

The amendment, when put, was carried and therefore became part of the substantive motion.

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Oil and Gas Exploration and Hydraulic Fracturing, and:

12. Amends the Right Debate section of the Long Term Plan to include:

“HBRC has heard the concerns of a number of its citizens and acknowledges the risk around the practice of hydraulic fracturing and has taken action to refer the matter to the Parliamentary Commissioner for the Environment. Should the Commissioner’s report include environmental effects that need addressing through the Regional Resource Management Plan then HBRC will undertake notifying the necessary plan changes.

HBRC values the protection of ecosystems in the region and recognises that mineral exploration/extraction poses long term risks to soil, water and ecosystems. HBRC will ensure all aspects of risk to soil, water and ecosystems are avoided, remedied or mitigated in each application for mineral exploration and extraction. ”

**Scott/Dick
CARRIED AS THE SUBSTANTIVE MOTION**

The meeting adjourned at 1.45pm and reconvened at 1.55pm.

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Mr Newman provided Councillors with clarification on the process proposed for investigating whether to proceed with the Ngaruroro feasibility study. It was noted that there was further economic analysis that needed to be completed as part of the pre-feasibility before a decision was made to proceed to a full feasibility study. Submitters had expressed both support and opposition for the proposal, much along the same lines as the Ruataniwha scheme but on a smaller scale. This project, if it proceeded, would be on a much smaller scale and would likely be used for augmenting rather than replacing water take consents.

All bar one of the submissions had supported increasing the protection provided by the Heretaunga Plains scheme, however they also signalled that this needed to be done with as little impact on rates as possible.

RC16/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Ngaruroro Water Storage Project, and:

13. Makes provision for \$27M for a possible equity stake in a water storage scheme in the Ngaruroro catchment. Approval to proceed will be subject to further economic assessment to be undertaken in the 2012/13 year as part of the pre-feasibility work. Undertaking a full feasibility assessment; and dependent on results, moving to further consultation, consenting and capital raising would require subsequent specific decisions.

**Gilbertson/Kirton
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Heretaunga Plains Flood Control Scheme, and:

14. Increases the level of protection provided by the Heretaunga Plains Flood Control Scheme to a 1-in-500 year level commencing in 2016/17, with the costs to be funded through scheme targeted rates (70%) and general funding (30%). This would allow for an annual capital programme worth about \$1M without increasing scheme rates above the level of inflation.

**Dick/Rose
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Regional Economic Development Strategy, and:

15. Increases the total rate take for economic development activity by \$120,000 from 2012/13 onwards specifically for increased activity in primary sector growth, Business Hawke's Bay and economic reporting.

**Dick/Wilson
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Investment Strategy, and:

16. Acknowledges the support for the retention of a majority shareholding in Port of Napier Limited and notes this is a strategic asset.

**Scott/Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Mrs Gilbertson provided information in relation to Transport issues raised by submitters and the staff response to those.

RC17/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Public Transport, and:

17. Continues to fund public transport activities in the region in accordance with the Regional Public Transport Plan, and subject to continued levels of subsidy by the New Zealand Transport Agency.

**von Dadelszen/Wilson
CARRIED**

18. In response to submissions, amends Route 17 to include Parkvale within the existing timetable.

**Dick/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

19. That Council receives the submission from Delaney Myers on behalf of NZ Transport Agency (15) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

There is work to be done initially, before any decisions about the GMO stance could be considered. For instance, the definition of the issue, i.e. GE, GMO, and whether it would be restricted to only cover field trials or field releases. The HDC hosted forum will provide the avenue for getting all parties involved in discussion of the options as set out in The Right Debate. Some sectors are wary of potential unintended negative impacts on research.

Mr Peter Moore, submission 78, had queried the basis for the section 36 charges he is being charged. Mr Miller advised that these charges were apportioned on a per consent basis, and have been consistently applied across the region on all consents. It was noted that this one issue was not addressed in the staff response and the submitter would be made aware of his options in this situation. Consents are now being issued for 'joint' frost protection and irrigation consents. It was noted that if Council still needed to monitor and collect data for the 2 different types of take (frost protection and irrigation), and recover the costs for that monitoring from the consent holder.

RC18/12 Resolutions

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to GMO Free, and:

20. Joins with interested parties in participating in a Hastings District Council hosted forum to determine a collective regional response to GMO and also considers the range of options in the Right Debate.

**Remmerswaal/Dick
CARRIED**

That Council:

21. Receives the submission from Mr Peter Moore (78), and the staff response, and makes no change to the Long Term Plan.

**Rose/Scott
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors agreed using a uniform annual charge on properties to fund Civil Defence functions provided more transparency for ratepayers.

Submissions received on the subject of webcasting Council meetings had all been in favour of the proposal and Councillors agreed that this would enable improved public participation and communication.

Councillors agreed that there was community support for a Solar Hot Water Scheme, although many had expressed their disappointment that the scheme did not extend to new homes being built and it was suggested that photovoltaic power be included. Staff advised that photovoltaic power would be included in the business case being developed to inform Council's decision on whether to proceed with a scheme.

RC19/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Civil Defence and Emergency Management Funding, and:

22. Introduces a uniform annual charge on all properties except those in the Rangitikei and Taupo districts, for the funding of Regional Civil Defence and Emergency Management.

**Dick/Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Webcasting of Council and Committee Meetings, and:

23. Approves capital expenditure of \$30,000 in the 2012/13 year for the installation of equipment to webcast Council and major Committee meetings.
24. Increases the budget for Project 895 (Community Engagement) by \$25,000 per annum for the operation of video webcasting of Council and major Committee meetings.

**Remmerswaal/Scott
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to a Solar Hot Water Scheme, and:

25. Makes provision for a loan facility of up to \$6 million for the funding of a Solar Hot Water Scheme, subject to final approval of a business case that also covers photovoltaic technology, by Council by December 2012.

**von Dadelszen/Scott
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Submissions received were generally supportive of catchment based plan changes and Councillors agreed with this approach to upcoming changes related to the Tukituki and Mohaka/Taharua catchments as priorities. Councillors also agreed that the Council's approach to community consultation on proposed plan changes was sufficient despite the concerns raised by Friends of the Tukituki.

Councillor Rose apologised for feeling unwell left the meeting at 3.15pm

Councillors agreed that the Investment Strategy put forward in the Plan provided adequate consideration of the risks involved and expressed general comfort with the proposals. There was some reservation about selling the Wellington properties, but to realise the concept of investing in Hawke's Bay for the benefit of Hawke's Bay this was necessary.

RC20/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Catchment Based Plan Changes, and:

26. Confirms the priorities for catchment based plan changes, being the Tukutuki, Taharua/Mohaka, and Heretaunga catchments, with financial provision confirmed in Project 192.
27. Confirms the provision in Project 192 of a total of \$105,000 over the next three years for the preparation and processing of a change to the Regional Policy Statement to improve policy direction on managing the effects of natural hazards on land use.

28. Receives the submission from Simon Lusk on behalf of Friends of the Tukituki (20) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Wilson/Scott
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to the Investment Strategy, and:

29. Confirms its Investment Strategy as proposed in the Right Debate section of the Long-Term Plan 2012-22.

**Wilson/Kirton
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Realisation of Value from Council's Investments in Leasehold Properties in Napier and Wellington and:

30. Approves the development of a proposal by staff for the selling of cash flows from rents paid by Napier leaseholders to affect the sell down by no later than 31 December 2012.

**Gilbertson/McGregor
CARRIED**

31. Agrees to sell its existing leasehold properties in Wellington, subject to final approval of a sale price by Council.

**Gilbertson/Kirton
CARRIED 7:1**

The meeting adjourned at 3.25pm and reconvened at 3.40pm

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors agreed that development of the Strategic and Research alliances was progressing well, and that submissions had been mostly supportive, especially for the Massey research alliance.

Concerns about the transfer of Tutira properties to hapu revolved around ensuring that the soil conservation and biodiversity work in the area not be lost. It was agreed that careful consideration would be given to the specific parcels that would be included in any transfer and the implications for the catchment as a whole. It was suggested that the existing Tutira and Tangoio management plans could form the basis for development of a Plan for the future of the entire catchment.

RC21/12 Resolutions

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Strategic and Research Alliances and:

32. Continues to advance the strategic alliance with the Department of Conservation, Horizons Regional Council and Greater Wellington Regional Council.
33. Maintains and grows its research alliance with Massey University.

**Gilbertson/Dick
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Transfer of Tutira properties, and:

34. Agrees in principle to the consideration of the exchange of properties in Tutira between HBRC and the Crown relating to the Tangoio Soil Conservation Reserve and land within or in the vicinity of Tutira Country Park.

**Kirton/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council staff continue to explore opportunities for shared services between local TLAs and HBRC, as well as participation in shared service arrangements with other regional councils, DoC and central government agencies.

Councillors expressed their concern at the number of requests for funding for projects which don't meet Council's criteria, are not aligned with Council activities or regional in nature, or are better aligned with the functions of TLAs or government agencies.

Councillors noted that there is no provision for Community Facilities funding beyond 2012/13, and that this is stated in the LTP.

RC22/12

Resolutions

That Council:

35. Commits in principle to participating in a Hawke's Bay Local Authority Shared Services Company and instructs staff to prepare a separate paper on the requirements for Council's participation.

**von Dadelszen/Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to requests for funding assistance and:

36. Declines the funding requests from MATES Trust, Hawke's Bay A&P Society, Art Deco Trust and Film Hawke's Bay and makes no change to the Long Term Plan.

**Dick/Gilbertson
Councillor McGregor expressed an interest and so did not vote.
FOR: Dick, Scott, Gilbertson, von Dadelszen, Kirton, Wilson
AGAINST: Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors agreed that a 15% increase in the amount of Enviroschools was warranted and noted that Central Government had recently announced the funding assistance they are going to provide to the Enviroschools Foundation.

FRESH Ed is a new programme offered by Inclusive Communities NZ, currently being trialled at a primary school in Wairoa. Targeted at primary and intermediate levels, it focuses on the core elements of sustainability and appears to be similar to Enviroschools programmes.

Councillors expressed support for 'partnership' funding arrangements where the recipients provided a service or work that contributes to Council's activities in exchange for funding, as in the case of ECOED.

RC23/12 **Resolutions**

That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Enviroschools and:

37. Approves the \$2100 increase to the Enviroschools annual funding and amends the Long Term Plan accordingly.

**Gilbertson/Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submission from Campbell Wiltshire on behalf of Inclusive Communities New Zealand (FRESH Ed) (12) and the staff comments and:

38. Declines the funding request and makes no change to the Long Term Plan.

**Scott/Wilson
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submission from ECOED (28) and the staff comments and:

39. Partners with ECOED for \$20k per year for the next two years for Pest Management work, to be funded from the Biosecurity budget.

**Scott/Kirton
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council confirmed that the three key criteria that projects need to meet for the Community Facilities Fund are: the value of the project; the percentage of contribution from this Council; the support of the related Local Territorial Authority.

Councillors discussed Council's 'partnership' with Te Taiwhenua o Heretaunga and future options for its future development.

RC24/12 **Resolutions**

That Council:

40. Receives the submission from the Douglas Lloyd Jenkins on behalf of the HB Museum and Art Gallery (170) and the staff comments, and declines the application for funding for the Regional Archive. The Council does, however, recognise there may be a case for some regional funding and will discuss this with the HB Museum and Art Gallery and the Council contributors for future consideration.

**Dick/Scott
CARRIED**

41. Receives the submission from Marei Apatu on behalf of Te Taiwhenua o Heretaunga (77) and the staff comments, and approves the provision of up to \$100,000 in 2012-13 for services provided by Te Taiwhenua o Heretaunga, with \$50,000 settled and \$50,000 to be allocated on a project basis for work associated with the Regional Planning Committee.

**Kirton/Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

42. Receives the submission from Meihana Watson on behalf of Omahu Marae (113) and the staff comments, declines the funding application and makes no change to the Long Term Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Council noted that investigations into Coastal erosion issues in the Region are ongoing and complex as in many other coastal communities nationally and internationally.

RC25/12 Resolutions

43. That pursuant to Model Standing Orders 3.3.7, Council agrees to continue the meeting past the six-hour limit.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

That Council receives the submission from Larry Dallimore (108) and the comments from staff and:

- 44 Notes that the LTP includes provision for continuing with the Westshore renourishment project jointly funded by HBRC and Napier City Council and makes no change to the Plan.

**Wilson/Scott
CARRIED**

That Council:

45. Receives the submissions from Ann Redstone (9), Margaret and Tony Warner (18), Lois Davis (20), Merryn Jones (82), Justin Reichs (81) and Mark Lawrence (38) and the comments from staff, and:

45.1 Notes the concerns raised by a number of submitters on the potential impact of gravel extraction from the region's beaches and rivers on coastal erosion

45.2 Advises the submitters that based on current knowledge Council does not believe that gravel extraction from the region's rivers has any significant impact on coastal erosion

45.3 Makes no change to the Plan.

**Gilbertson/Scott
CARRIED**

46. Receives the submission from Keith Newman on behalf of WOW Inc (37) and the comments from staff and:

46.1 Notes that there is no specific provision with the LTP to continue coastal investigation work specifically targeted to Haumoana and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

An amendment was moved by Councillor Remmerswaal and seconded by Councillor Gilbertson, being to add 46.2:

46.2 Delegates to the Chairman to discuss with the Mayor of Hastings District Council their proposal to establish a working party involving HBRC to further consider the issue and report back to Council to enable Council to make a decision on whether or not it agrees to participate in that Working Party.

**Gilbertson/Remmerswaal
For: Gilbertson, Remmerswaal
Against: Dick, McGregor, Scott, von Dadelszen, Kirton, Wilson
LOST**

47. Receives the submissions from Rod Heaps (111), Ian Chapman (112) and the Clifton Reserve Society (80), and the comments from staff and:
- 47.1 Notes that there is no provision within the LTP for Council involvement in any potential work requested by submitters and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors expressed concern at the drop in visitor nights throughout the region, and in Napier in particular and suggested discussions be entered into with industry representatives and HB Tourism in an effort to find ways to address the situation.

RC26/12 **Resolutions**

That Council:

48. Receives the submission from Napier Motel Association (32) and requests that the Chairman and Chief Executive meet with the Mayors of Napier and Hastings and HB Tourism to discuss the issue of decline in visitor numbers, and reports back to Council and the submitters, and makes no change to the Plan.

**Dick/Kirton
CARRIED**

49. Receives the submission from Ewan McGregor (144) and the staff comments and makes no change to the Plan.

**Kirton/Dick
CARRIED**

Councillor Dick left the meeting at 4.55pm

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

The meeting adjourned at 5pm and reconvened at 5.20pm.

Councillors discussed the Smokefree messages requested by the submitters and suggested that staff investigate the costs associated with adding a smokefree message to Council signage at recreation areas.

Support by submitters for the general direction of Council's community engagement activities was noted.

Councillors expressed their desire for further work to be done on investigating possibilities for development of cycleways and pathways in Central Hawke's Bay as an extension of what was available in Hastings and Napier.

RC27/12 **Resolutions**

That Council:

50. Receives the submissions from the Hawkes Bay & Chatham Islands Smokefree Coalition (29) and Cancer Society of NZ - Hawke's Bay Centre (5) and comments from staff and:

50.1 Makes no change to the Plan

50.2 Suggests that staff include the message "we prefer our Parks to be Smokefree" on any new Council signage.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

51. Receives the submissions and staff comments related to Community Engagement and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/McGregor
CARRIED**

52. Receives the submissions from Rotary Club Waipukurau (136) and Central Hawke's Bay District Council Mayor Peter Butler (16) and the comments from staff and:

52.1 makes no change to the Plan

52.2 meets with CHB District Council and Rotary Club Waipukurau to discuss a Plan for the development of cycleway options in CHB.

**Scott/McGregor
CARRIED**

53. Receives the submission from Christopher Ratcliffe (166) and the comments from staff in relation to a cycleway connecting Napier and Hastings, and makes no change to the Plan.

**von Dadelszen/McGregor
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors discussed the ongoing problem of rubbish dumping along riverbanks and recreational reserves. Although Operations staff were occasionally able to identify those responsible, the problem was too widespread to be able to effectively stop it happening.

Calls for the Maori Committee Chairman to have a vote at Council meetings were supported, however not possible under current legislation and this would be explained in responses to submitters who had raised this.

Councillors noted that HBRC had set goals for its offices in relation to responding to responding to climate change and reducing its carbon footprint. Council was not operating in the regulating of CO2 emissions space in the region, however.

RC28/12

Resolutions

That Council:

54. Receives the submission from Derek Williams (50) and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Kirton
CARRIED**

55. Receives the submission from Pauline Tangiora (30) and makes no change to the Plan.

**von Dadelszen/Scott
CARRIED**

56. Receives the submission from John Warren (35) in relation to CO2 emissions and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Kirton
For: McGregor, Scott, Gilbertson, von Dadelszen, Kirton, Wilson
Against: Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

It was noted that Council had previously decided to support applications for wind farms in the region through its statutory advocacy activities. Councillors did not consider any change to the Plan necessary in response to comments from submitters about opposition to corporate wind farms as they were outside the scope of the Plan.

Councillors noted comments in Mr Gwynn's submission in relation to international trade agreements were outside the scope of the LTP and Council's functions and activities. The other points raised in the submission had been addressed via the relative topics.

Councillors noted that the Prosperity Study would shed more light on what government structures might be best to enable economic growth in the Region.

RC29/12

Resolutions

That Council:

57. Receives submissions 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45 and 47 and staff comments in relation to opposition to corporate wind farms and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

58. Receives the submission from Robin Gwynn (63) and the comments from staff and makes no statutory advocacy approaches to Government in relation to the Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement, and no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Wilson
CARRIED**

59. Receives the submissions from Barry Crabbe (79) and A & O Bowen (21) and the comments from staff in relation to the amalgamation of the local councils and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors expressed their concern for the community in North Clyde and suggested that staff follow up with Ms Dawson where appropriate. Although there is nothing in Council's LTP that will address the situation, avenues for seeking solutions had been suggested to the community for them to pursue in seeking resolution to their issues.

Councillors agreed that the suggestion to include reference to the 'high value productive land' in the goal for a resilient economy was worthwhile to provide better focus.

RC30/12

Resolutions

That Council:

60. Receives the submission from Julianna Dawson on behalf of North Clyde in Focus Inc (107) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**von Dadelszen/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

61. Receives the submission from Jean Anderson on behalf of Physicians and Scientists for Global Responsibility (22) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Wilson/Scott
CARRIED**

62. Receives the submission from Dan Bloomer (119) and the comments from staff and amends the goal under Resilient Economy to include “high value productive land”.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

63. Receives the submission from Diane Charteris (159) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

64. Receives the submission from Frank Haywood (183) and the comments from staff in relation to Raupare Stream enhancement and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Wilson
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors reviewed the Register of submissions and commenced resolving those not yet specifically covered.

RC31/12

Resolutions

65. That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Water Management, and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

That Council:

66. Receives the submission from Mark von Dadelszen (6) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

Councillor von Dadelszen declared an interest and so did not vote

**Scott/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

67. Receives the submission from Bill Withers (7) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Wilson/Scott
CARRIED**

68. Receives the submission from Colin Stone on behalf of Sport Hawke’s Bay (13) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/von Dadelszen
CARRIED**

69. Receives the submission from Mac Kirkwood on behalf of the Karamu Enhancement Group (36) and the comments from staff in relation to Karamu Stream enhancement and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Wilson
CARRIED**

3. SUBMISSIONS ON THE DRAFT LONG TERM PLAN 2012-22

Councillors agreed that references to resilience in the Plan were adequately defined and understood.

RC32/12 Resolutions

70. That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Resilience, and makes no change to the Plan.

**von Dadelszen/Wilson
CARRIED**

71. That Council receives the submissions and the staff comments in relation to Rates, and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Wilson
CARRIED**

That Council:

72. Receives the submission from Hastings District Council (114) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

73. Receives the submission from Federated Farmers (192) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Wilson/Remmerswaal
CARRIED**

74. Receives the submission from Murray Douglas on behalf of the Hawke's Bay Chamber of Commerce (195) and the comments from staff and makes no change to the Plan.

**Scott/Gilbertson
CARRIED**

Closure:

There being no further business the Chairman declared the meeting closed at 6.15pm on Thursday, 14 June 2012.

Signed as a true and correct record.

DATE:

CHAIRMAN: